# CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

\_\_\_\_\_



Seventy-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee Lyon (France), 7 - 11 March 2022

#### **SUMMARY**

### FRIDAY 11 MARCH AFTERNOON

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the following draft decisions to replace Decision 18.159 to 18.164:

#### Directed to the Secretariat

#### **19.AA** The Secretariat shall:

- a) continue to collect information on existing networks and resources on the management of seized and confiscated live animals and make it available to Parties on the CITES website;
- b) subject to the availability external funding, develop and make available materials that may assist Parties in implementing Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 17.8 on *Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species*, as needed; and
- c) report to the Standing Committee on the implementation of this Decision.

#### **Directed to Parties**

**19.BB** Parties are encouraged to make use of the information and materials made available by the Secretariat on the CITES webpage dedicated to the disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens.

#### Directed to Parties and relevant stakeholders

- 19.CC Parties and relevant stakeholders that have not already done so are invited to share with the Secretariat information on existing networks and resources on the management of seized and confiscated live animals in place in their country, including any action plans, protocols, regulatory measures, standard operating procedures developed to coordinate actions among public authorities, and guidelines for the management of specific species or genera.
- **19.DD** Parties, governmental, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations and other entities are invited to provide financial and/or technical assistance, as relevant, for the implementation of Decision 19.AA, paragraph b).

#### Directed to the Standing Committee

**19.EE** The Standing Committee shall consider the report submitted by the Secretariat under Decision 19.AA and make recommendations, as appropriate.

The Committee invited Parties with additional draft decisions to submit those to CoP19.

53. Quotas for leopard (Panthera pardus) hunting trophies:

The Committee agreed to propose to CoP19 to amend paragraph 1 a) of Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP16) on *Quotas for leopard hunting trophies and skins for personal use* by changing the quota indicated for Ethiopia from "500" to "20".

The Committee agreed to propose to CoP19 draft amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP16) so as to remove quotas for Kenya and Malawi from this Resolution.

The Committee agreed to propose to CoP19 the following amendments:

- a) amendments to paragraph 5 of the Interpretation Section of the Appendices, to the parenthetical annotation to Appendix I Orchidaceae, to Annotation #1, to Annotation #4 and to Annotation #14,
  - 5. As none of the species or higher taxa of FLORA included in Appendix I is annotated to the effect that its hybrids shall be treated in accordance with the provisions of Article III of the Convention, this means that artificially propagated hybrids produced from one or more of these species or taxa may be traded with a certificate of artificial propagation, and that seeds and pollen (including pollinia), cut flowers, seedling or tissue cultures obtained *in vitro*, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers of these hybrids are not subject to the provisions of the Convention.

### **ORCHIDACEAE**

Orchids (For all of the following Appendix-I species, seedling or tissue cultures obtained *in vitro*, in solid or liquid media, and transported in sterile containers are not subject to the provisions of the Convention only if the specimens meet the definition of 'artificially propagated' agreed by the Conference of the Parties.

- #1 All parts and derivatives, except:
  - a) seeds, spores and pollen (including pollinia);
  - b) seedling or tissue cultures obtained *in vitro*, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers;
  - c) cut flowers of artificially propagated plants; and
  - d) fruits, and parts and derivatives thereof, of artificially propagated plants of the genus *Vanilla*.

### #4 All parts and derivatives, except:

- a) seeds (including seedpods of Orchidaceae), spores and pollen (including pollinia). The exemption does not apply to seeds from Cactaceae spp. exported from Mexico, and to seeds from Beccariophoenix madagascariensis and Dypsis decaryi exported from Madagascar;
- seedling or tissue cultures obtained in vitro, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers:
- c) cut flowers of artificially propagated plants;
- d) fruits, and parts and derivatives thereof, of naturalized or artificially propagated plants of the genus Vanilla (Orchidaceae) and of the family Cactaceae;
- e) stems, flowers, and parts and derivatives thereof, of naturalized or artificially propagated plants of the genera *Opuntia* subgenus *Opuntia* and *Selenicereus* (Cactaceae); and
- f) finished products of *Aloe ferox* and *Euphorbia antisyphilitica* packaged and ready for retail trade.

### #14 All parts and derivatives except:

- a) seeds and pollen;
- b) seedling or tissue cultures obtained *in vitro*, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers;

- c) fruits;
- d) leaves:
- e) exhausted agarwood powder, including compressed powder in all shapes; and
- f) finished products packaged and ready for retail trade, this exemption does not apply to wood chips, beads, prayer beads and carvings.
- b) amendments to annotation #14:
  - f) finished products packaged and ready for retail trade; this exemption does not apply to wood chips, beads, prayer beads and carvings.
  - f) les produits finis conditionnés et prêts pour la vente au détail; cette dérogation ne s'applique pas aux copeaux <del>en</del> <u>de</u> bois, <u>aux</u> perles, aux grains de chapelets et aux gravures.
- c) amendments to paragraph 7 of the Interpretation Section of the Appendices:
  - 7. When a species is included in Appendiesx I, II or III, the whole, live or dead, animal or plant is always included. In addition, all parts and derivatives thereof are also included in the same Appendix unless, for animal species listed in Appendix III and plant species listed in Appendix II or III, all parts and derivatives of the species are also included in the same Appendix unless the species is annotated with the symbol # followed by a number to indicate that only specific parts and derivatives are included. The symbol # followed by a number placed against the name of a species or higher taxon included in Appendix II or III refers to a footnote that indicates the parts or derivatives of animals or plants that are designated as 'specimens' subject to the provisions of the Convention in accordance with Article I, paragraph (b), subparagraph (ii) or (iii).
- d) amendments to the definitions of Ten (10) kg per shipment and of transformed wood in paragraph 8 of the Interpretation Section of the Appendices:

### Ten (10) kg per shipment

For the term "10 kg per shipment", the 10 kg limit should be interpreted as referring to the weight of wood of the individual portions of each item in the shipment made of wood of the species concerned each individual annotated species of genus Dalbergia or Guibourtia present in the items in the shipment. In other words, t The 10 kg limit is to be assessed only against the individual weights of the individual portions of wood of Dalbergia/Guibourtia each individual annotated species contained in each item of the shipment, and not against rather than against the total weight of the shipment. The total weights present of each individual annotated species are considered individually to determine whether a CITES permit or certificate is required for each individual annotated species, and weights of different individual annotated species are not added together for this purpose.

### Transformed wood

Defined by Harmonized System code 44.09: Wood (including strips, friezes for parquet flooring, not assembled), continuously shaped (tongued, grooved, <u>rebated</u>, <u>champhered</u>, <u>vV-jointed</u>, beaded, <u>moulded</u>, <u>rounded</u> or the like) along any <u>of its</u> edges, ends or faces, whether or not planed, sanded or end-jointed.

The Committee noted the advice provided by the working group in paragraphs 7 through 9 on exceptions for seedling or tissue cultures obtained *in vitro* transported in sterile containers and on the proposed addition of a new paragraph g) on retail trade of cosmetics to Annotation #4 by the Management Authority of Switzerland and Liechtenstein and in paragraph 19 on inclusion of the definitions of logs, sawn wood, veneer sheets, and plywood currently located in paragraph 1 c) of Resolution Conf. 10.13 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for tree species* in paragraph 8 of the Interpretation Section of the Appendices.

The Committee requested the Secretariat, in consultation with the Standing Committee Chair, to revise Decision 16.162 (Rev. CoP18) deleting those directives that have been accomplished, and to submit a revised Decision to CoP19, proposing its adoption by the Conference of the Parties.

### 82. Mechanisms and information system for the review

The Committee invited the Secretariat to take note of the concerns and comments expressed by Belgium, Switzerland and the North American region about the annotations review mechanism and the use of HS codes.

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the following draft decisions:

### Directed to the Standing Committee

18.317 (Rev. CoP19) The Standing Committee shall explore the feasibility and requirements for developing an information system for the purpose of processing trade data associated with transactions in specimens of CITES-listed tree species authorized under the provisions of the Convention and submit any relevant recommendations to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### Directed to the Secretariat

19.AA Subject to external funding, the Secretariat shall commission a study exploring the feasibility and requirements for developing an information system as proposed and provide its findings and recommendations to the Standing Committee.

The Committee invited the Standing Committee Chair, in consultation with the Secretariat, to submit to CoP19 two draft decisions: one directing the Secretariat to prepare a proposal for an informal mechanism to provide advice on annotations and another directing the Standing Committee to evaluate the proposal by the Secretariat and to make recommendations to CoP20.

### 

The Committee agree to propose to CoP19 the renewal of Decisions 18.321 and 18.322 on Annotation #15 as follows:

### 18.321 (Rev. CoP19) Directed to the Secretariat

The Secretariat shall:

- subject to available resources, undertake a study to assess the effect on Dalbergia/Guibourtia species in international trade of the exemptions contained in annotation #15 for finished musical instruments, parts and accessories, and the conservation implications thereof;
- b) bring any scientific or technical issues to the attention of the Plants Committee and seek its advice; and
- c) report the results of its evaluation along with its recommendations to the Standing Committee.

### 18.322 (Rev. CoP19) Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall in the context of its work on annotations under the relevant Decisions, consider any report by the Secretariat in accordance with Decision 18.321 (Rev. CoP19), undertake additional evaluation if necessary and report to the 19th 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. If warranted, the Standing Committee may work with relevant Parties in preparing an amendment proposal for the 19th 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

### 

The Committee agreed to propose to CoP19 the renewal of Decision 18.151 as follows:

### 18.151 (Rev. CoP19) Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall, with the assistance of the Secretariat, consider whether further guidance related to the period of transition, including the period between the adoption of a proposal to transfer a species from one Appendix to another and the entry into force of the new listing, should be developed and, if so, present amendments to an existing Resolution or a new draft resolution to the 19th 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. In this context, the Standing Committee shall consider, in consultation with the Plants Committee, as appropriate, whether special recommendations should apply in the case of a transfer of a tree species with Annotation #5 or other annotated plant species.

### 85. Guidance for the publication of the Appendices:

The Committee invited the Secretariat to take into account the comments made by Canada, China, Israel and Poland as it finalizes the draft *Guidance for the publication of the Appendices* in the Annex to document SC74 Doc. 85 before its publication on the CITES website.

The Committee agreed to propose to CoP19 that the following sub-paragraph 4 f) be inserted in Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP18) on Submission of draft resolutions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties:

f) to take account of the Guidance for the publication of the Appendices, as may be amended in consultation with the Standing Committee, when revising the Appendices after a meeting of the Conference of the Parties

The Committee noted the issues outlined in document SC74 Doc. 85, *inter alia* the possibility of harmonizing references to "zero quotas" in the Appendices and of including higher taxa listings in accordance with Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II*, and invited the Secretariat to examine how best these issues could be advanced in draft decisions proposed for submission to CoP19.

- - a) The Committee requested the Secretariat to conduct a survey on how other biodiversity Multilateral Environmental Agreements and natural resources management bodies are handling language services for their working languages and for their non-working languages, including those that do not have any language strategies.
  - b) The Committee requested the Secretariat to present new options including those outlined in document SC74 Doc. 19, and including those developed through information received by the Secretariat in its survey pursuant to paragraph a) and discussions from the Finance and Budget Subcommittee at SC74 for further review at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
  - c) The Committee noted the views expressed about the different options for a language strategy expressed by Australia, Belgium (on behalf of the European Union and its Member States), Canada, China, Israel, Japan, Kuwait, Oman, Peru, Senegal, Somalia, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, and Uzbekistan.

#### Report of the Finance and Budget Subcommittee

The Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC74 Com. 4 as follows:

The Committee:

- a) approved the reports on the costed programme of work for the full years 2019 and 2020, and for the period up to 30 September 2021;
- b) noted the projected savings for the core Trust Fund (CTL) for the year 2021;

- c) approved the transfer of resources from the expected savings from 2021 under the meeting related components in the amount of USD 336,600 to cover the cost of the organization for the governing bodies meetings during 2022, on a one-time exceptional basis;
- d) invited the Conference of the Parties to further review the participation charges for all observer organizations other than the UN and its specialized agencies at meeting of the governing bodies of the Convention and make determination on the use of those collected charges; and
- e) noted the other information provided in the report.

The Committee noted the report and requested the Secretariat to take into account feedback received and outcomes from the 74th meeting of the Standing Committee in preparation of the proposed budget scenarios for the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### 10. Administrative matters

The Committee:

- a) appreciated the continued contribution by the host country of the Secretariat;
- b) noted the document by the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) on the allocation and utilization of programme support cost;
- noted of the evaluation of central administrative costs following the adoption of Umoja, in particular, the classification into core (indirect) and common (direct) administrative costs, to be interpreted and applied in the new context;
- d) noted the outstanding bills due to the UN Office at Geneva (UNOG) for administrative services provided, and request the UNEP Executive Director to authorize the utilization by CITES of the unspent programme support fund balance at the closure of financial year 2021, to settle the outstanding bills amounting to US\$ 232,309, notwithstanding UNEP's current policy that restricts carrying forward positive balances at closure of UNEP biennial financial period;
- e) requested that UNEP provide in its report to the 75th meeting of the Standing Committee and 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties any update to UNEP's current policy that restricts carrying forward positive balances at closure of biennial financial period to the detriment of Multilateral Environment Agreements;
- deferred to CoP19 the question of whether to consider possible supplementary funding sources for future administrative costs when Programme Support Cost is inadequate; and
- g) welcomed the audit by the Office of Internal Oversight services (OIOS) conducted in 2021 and requested the Secretariat to provide update on implementation of recommendations at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

and

The Committee agreed to keep this item under further review.

## 69. CITES Big Cats Task Force (Felidae spp.):

The Committee agreed with the revised terms of reference and *modus operandi* for the CITES Big Cats Task Force presented in document SC74 Com. 1 as follows:

#### TERMS OF REFERENCE

#### Task Force activities

- 1. The Task Force will:
  - discuss enforcement and implementation challenges and similarities between illegal trade in different species of big cats, including by considering national and regional wildlife enforcement efforts related to big cats and lessons that could be learnt from them, or by identifying gaps that may exist, as appropriate;
  - b) identify opportunities to address illegal trade in big cat specimens, taking into consideration species-specific trade dynamics<sup>1</sup>, and prioritize actions to better address this illegal trade;
  - c) share information about the nature and scale of the illegal trade in specimens of CITES listed big cats and associated illegal trade routes, and identify knowledge gaps;
  - d) provide a platform for the exchange of intelligence and other information relating to illegal trade in big cats, and identify mechanisms to do so on a regular basis;
  - e) share information about techniques <u>(including the use of forensic methods)</u>, tools and processes for identifying big cat specimens in trade, consider <u>developing new and harmonizing existing</u> approaches for better roll out and use of these techniques and tools across Parties, and identify needs and knowledge gaps;
  - f) consider in its deliberations the findings of available verified and validated studies, such as those conducted in accordance with <u>Decision 18.246</u>, <u>paragraph a</u>) <u>on African lions</u> (Panthera leo) <u>and the CITES Big Cats Task Force</u>, and Decision 18.251 on <u>Jaguars</u> (Panthera onca), as well as previous CITES studies on Asian big cats, cheetahs and lions, and the <u>2020 World Wildlife Crime Report</u>.
  - g) identify, consider and propose best practices to prevent and detect attempts to launder illegal specimens through legal trade, including trade originating from captive-bred sources;
  - h) discuss demand for <u>live big cats</u>, big cat parts and derivatives and the implications it has for illegal trade in different big cat species, including areas of convergence and supplementing or substituting of one species with another; and
  - i) develop strategies and propose actions to improve international cooperation and the enforcement of CITES to address illegal trade in specimens of big cats, to be presented to the Standing Committee in accordance with Decision 18.245, paragraph d), for its consideration.

#### Outcomes

- 2. The Task Force will generate the following outcomes:
  - a) a better understanding of enforcement priorities relating to illegal trade in specimens of big cats;
  - b) improved understanding and take-up of tools, techniques (including forensic methods) and best practices to identify big cat specimens in trade; their use for enforcement purposes to address illegal trade; and better knowledge of relevant forensic facilities, research institutions, and developments;

Some big cat specimens may be trafficked as live animals and others as parts and derivatives.

- c) enhanced exchange of intelligence and other information on illegal trade in big cat specimens <u>via</u> the existing official channels to the extent possible;
- d) a better understanding of the status, scale, and dynamics of illegal trade for different big cat species, including the convergence of big cat species in illegal trade chains;
- e) an enhanced understanding of the gaps in knowledge and capability that hinder efforts to tackle the illegal trade in big cat specimens;
- f) a better understanding of illegal trade dynamics to inform demand reduction strategies concerning big cat specimens illegally traded; and
- g) improved understanding of the role of legal trade in big cat specimens on poaching of and illegal trade in big cat species, and the impact of legal domestic markets as a driver of illegal trade in big cat species.
- h) improved understanding of the role of legal trade in big cat specimens on combating poaching of and illegal trade in big cat species,
- i) improved understanding of trade in specimens originating from captive bred sources and the potential linkage with laundering of illegal specimens from and through such facilities.

#### <u>Outputs</u>

- 3. The Task Force will generate the following outputs:
  - a) proposals to facilitate strengthened collaboration and targeted activities that promote effective implementation and enforcement the Convention to address illegal trade in big cat specimens; and
  - b) strategies and proposed actions to better deter, detect and address illegal trade in big cat specimens, to be presented to the Standing Committee in accordance with Decision 18.245, paragraph d), for its consideration; and
  - c) time-bound recommendations as appropriate.

#### MODUS OPERANDI

### Prioritization of Parties and big cat species

- 4. To make the Task Force meeting as practical and constructive as possible, the Secretariat initiated a process of prioritization to identify Parties for participation in the Task Force, and to determine the big cat species most affected by illegal trade for the Task Force to focus on. The prioritization of Parties and big cat species are based on various sources of information and data, that included:
  - a) big cat species most significantly affected by illegal trade, based on available illegal trade data (e.g. seizure data from annual illegal trade reports);
  - b) Parties identified in document <u>SC70 Doc. 51 and the Annexes to it, Annex 4 to document CoP18 Doc. 71.1 on Asian big cats</u>, and concerned by <u>Decisions 18.100 to 18.102</u>, and 18.105;
  - c) information on source, transit and destination countries most affected by illegal trade in specimens of big cat species, based on available documentation, studies and reports, for example documents <a href="SC65 Doc. 39">SC65 Doc. 39</a> (Rev. 2), <a href="SC66 Doc. 32.5 A1">SC70 Doc. 43</a> and <a href="CoP18 Doc. 60">CoP18 Doc. 60</a> on illegal trade in cheetahs; the Annex to document <a href="SC70 54.1">SC70 Doc. 43</a> and <a href="CoP18 Doc. 60">CoP18 Doc. 60</a> on illegal trade in cheetahs; the Annex to document <a href="SC70 54.1">SC70 Doc. 43</a> and <a href="CoP18 Doc. 60">CoP18 Doc. 60</a> on illegal trade in Doc. 71.1 concerning illegal trade in jaguars; document SC74 Doc 75 on <a href="Jaguars">Jaguars</a> (Panthera onca); document SC74 Doc. 36 on <a href="Asian big cats">Asian big cats</a> (Felidae spp.) and the Annexes to it, and the <a href="2020 World Wildlife Crime Report">2020 World Wildlife Crime Report</a>;
- 5. Other sources that could be considered to facilitate further prioritization includes:
  - a) the results of the study that the Secretariat is instructed to produce on legal and illegal trade in African lions and other big cats as per <u>Decision 18.246</u>, <u>paragraph a</u>), <u>subject to its availability</u>; <u>and</u>

- b) any credible and verified information that may be presented in accordance with <a href="Decision 18.246">Decision 18.246</a>, <a href="paragraph e">paragraph e</a>) on African lions (Panthera leo) and the CITES Big Cats Task Force and from other credible data sources such as academic field research concerning illegal trade in big cat specimens.
- 6. Analysis of data and information primarily from the sources mentioned in paragraph 4 above, indicates that the following key big cat species are of priority concern: cheetah (*Acinonyx jubatus*), mainland clouded leopard (*Neofelis nebulosa*), Sunda clouded leopard (*Neofelis diardi*), lion (*Panthera leo*), jaguar (*Panthera onca*), leopard (*Panthera pardus*), tiger (*Panthera tigris*) and snow leopard (*Panthera uncia*).
- 7. Analysis of data and information primarily from the sources mentioned in paragraph 4 above, identified the following Parties as Parties that may be affected by illegal trade in big cats: Afghanistan, Australia, Bangladesh, Bhutan, Bolivia (Plurinational State of), Brazil, Botswana, Cambodia, China, Czech Republic, Ethiopia, France, Germany, India, Indonesia, Kenya, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Malawi, Malaysia, Mexico, Mongolia, Mozambique, Myanmar, Namibia, Nepal, Netherlands, New Zealand, Peru, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Somalia, South Africa, Spain, Suriname, Thailand, Yemen, United Arabs Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America, United Republic of Tanzania, Viet Nam, and Zambia. Some of the Parties included in the list were identified through analysis of illegal trade data and are included because they have made large numbers of big cat seizures, suggesting efficiency in their detection of illegal trade in big cat specimens. Participation of these Parties in the Task Force could facilitate and promote exchanges concerning possible best practices and solutions.
- 8. Based on the findings of the CITES study on lions and other big cats as per <u>Decision 18.246</u>, <u>paragraph a)</u>, still to be completed, and any new illegal trade data that may become available, additional Parties and big cat species may be added.

### Membership of the Task Force

- 9. In accordance with the provisions of Decision 18.245 paragraph b), the Task Force will be established and convened by the Secretariat in consultation with the Standing Committee, and include representatives from:
  - Parties most affected by illegal trade in big cats;
  - big cat range States with the largest populations;
  - representatives from the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) partner organizations;
  - other Parties and organizations, as appropriate; and
  - experts who the Secretariat determines may contribute to the Task Force.
- 10. To ensure that maximum benefit is derived from the Task Force, Parties most affected by illegal trade in big cat specimens and identified through the prioritization process described in paragraphs 4 to 8 above, are encouraged to make every effort to participate in the Task Force.
- 11. The Secretariat has limited funding available to support the participation of up to two representatives from eligible key Parties identified as affected by illegal trade in big cats, who are not in the position to cover their costs. These Parties may wish to nominate additional representatives at their own expense. Subject to the availability of funds, the Secretariat may on a case-by-case basis consider supporting the participation of a third representative. To ensure multidisciplinary representation, the representatives that these Parties nominate should be from CITES authorities, police, customs, wildlife agencies or prosecutorial authorities. The nominated representatives should have relevant expertise on the subject matter and be able to contribute to the activities and outputs of the Task Force.
- 12. As indicated in paragraph 9 above, other Parties, organizations and experts with relevant experience or knowledge, or that work actively on big cat related matters will be identified and engaged. This could for example include Parties that have shown a long-standing interest in big cat issues, civil society organizations and individual experts, and entities such as the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS)

and the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), referenced in the Decisions on *African lions* (Panthera leo) *and the CITES Big Cats Task Force*, and associated with the implementation of key aspects of these Decisions. They will be encouraged to fund their own participation. Subject to the availability of funds, the Secretariat may be able to support the participation of one representative from some of these entities on a case-by-case basis.

13. Parties and organizations are encouraged to take into consideration gender diversity in the nomination of representatives.

#### Meeting agenda

14. The meeting agenda will be developed by the Secretariat in consultation with the Chairs of the Standing and Animals Committees.

### Format and conduct of the Task Force

- 15. Ideally, the Task Force meeting should take place in a face-to-face setting. This will however be influenced by the developments concerning the COVID-19 pandemic and the related restrictive measures in place. If a face-to-face meeting will not be possible, online meetings may have to be contemplated.

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the following amended draft decisions from document SC74 Com. 2 to replace Decision 18.172 and 18.173:

### 19.AA Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall:

- a) <u>continue to</u> consider amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) and Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP18), <u>as well as any amendment to other Resolutions</u> concerning provisions on trade in specimens of CITES-listed animals and plants not of wild source, taking into account findings and suggestions in document SC74 Doc. 56 and any related comments and recommendations from the Standing Committee, Parties, the Secretariat or other stakeholders;
- b) review issues and challenges in the application of the Convention for trade in non-wild specimens of CITES-listed animal and plant species, in particular key elements that may contribute to the uneven application of Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5, and communicate to consider the scientific advice and guidance from the Animals and Plants Committees on the need for implementing these Articles differently for either animal specimens from species bred in captivity or plant specimens that are artificially propagated any matters that may require scientific advice and guidance, as appropriate; and
- c) make recommendations for addressing these issues and challenges, including amendments to existing Resolutions or development of a new Resolution or Decisions to address these issues and challenges, for consideration at the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### 19.BB Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

In support of the Standing Committee's implementation of Decision 19.AA, the Animals and Plants Committees shall:

- a) consider the key elements in the current implementation of Article VII paragraphs 4 and 5 for animals and plants, respectively, in the current applicable Resolutions;
- b) determine if there is a need to implement Article VII paragraphs 4 and 5 differently for either animal specimens from species bred in captivity or plant specimens that are artificially propagated than what is outlined in existing Resolutions, and provide their recommendations to the Standing Committee in time for its 78th meeting; and

c) provide <u>any other</u> scientific advice and guidance on CITES provisions concerning trade in non-wild specimens of CITES-listed animal and plant species to the Standing Committee upon request and as appropriate.

### 35. Wildlife crime enforcement support in West and Central Africa

- 35.1 Inclusion of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* in the Review of Significant Trade

and

The Committee agreed the compromise text proposed by Poland and amended by the Standing Committee Chair and the United States of America based on option 2 in document SC74 Com. 3 as follows:

- 1. The Committee requested the Secretariat to:
  - a) open an Article XIII procedure for *Pterocarpus erinaceus* for all range States based on the exceptional circumstances due to pervasive documented illegal trade;
  - issue a Notification directly after the end of this meeting requesting the range States to submit within 30 days a justification that the Article XIII procedure is not applicable to them, by either providing their non-detriment finding and legal acquisition finding, or by requesting the Secretariat to publish a voluntary zero export quota;
  - c) after having received and analyzed the responses from the range States, in consultation with the Chairs of the Standing Committee and of the Plants Committee, issue a Notification informing Parties that a suspension is set in place for all commercial trade in *Pterocarpus erinaceus* for those Parties that did not reply or did not provide a satisfying justification.
- 2. The Committee called upon the Plants Committee to expedite its Review of Significant Trade of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* in order for the Committee to receive a progress report from the Plants Committee at SC75.
- 3. In anticipation of the Notification mentioned in paragraph 1. c), the Committee requested importing Parties to reject all export permits concerning Pterocarpus erinaceus, based on concerns related to the sustainability and legality of the specimens and exercising due diligence having regard to Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP18) on Compliance and enforcement, and requested the Secretariat to issue a Notification to the Parties to this effect.
- 4. The Committee requested that all CITES permits and certificates for *Pterocarpus erinaceus* be verified by the Secretariat prior to acceptance by importing Parties.
- 5. In the light of the recommendations in the Outcome Document of the CITES Task Force meeting on illegal trade in specimens of listed tree species, the Committee encouraged range States for *Pterocarpus erinaceus* to:
  - explore opportunities to initiate targeted regional operations with support from the UNODC/WCO Container Control Programme;
  - b) undertake risk assessments to develop risk profiles specific to *Pterocarpus erinaceus* and to reach out to the WCO for support where needed;
  - c) capacitate and provide training to frontline officers responsible for physical inspections regarding timber identification, aiming to have at least one officer

available with expert knowledge concerning timber and access to equipment to facilitate such work, seeking support from the Secretariat where required.

6. Further, the Committee recalled the recommendations adopted at CoP18 in Annex 2 of document CoP18 Doc. 34 based on the West and Central Africa Threat Assessment Report, and encouraged Parties to pursue the implementation of these recommendations as relevant to them, also specifically in the context of combatting illegal trade in *Pterocarpus erinaceus*.

The Committee noted the concerns expressed by Parties and agreed the recommendations in document SC74 Com. 5 as follows:

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the following amendment to paragraph 27 g) of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens:* 

27. g) summaries and aggregates of data provided to MIKE and ETIS, and the analyses of such data, constitute information that will be considered to be in the public domain once they are published on the CITES website, or otherwise publicly distributed; the detailed data on individual seizure cases, elephant mortalities and law enforcement submitted to MIKE or ETIS are owned by the respective data providers, which in most case are the CITES Parties; any such data relating to a CITES Party will be accessible to that Party, and the members of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group for information and review purposes, and the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) for global research and analysis, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, in accordance with paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports, but will not be released to any third party without the consent of the Party concerned; data may also be released to contractors (e.g. statisticians) or other researchers (e.g. MIKE ETIS Subgroup approved research collaborations) under appropriate nondisclosure agreements; and

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the proposed amendments to Annex 1 on *Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens* to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) contained in Annex 4 to document SC74 Doc. 12 with amendments in document SC74 Com. 5 as follows:

#### Annex 1 Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens

### 1. Introduction

In order to monitor and record levels of illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens on a global basis, there is a need for a system to collect and compile law enforcement data on seizures and confiscations. At its 10th meeting, the Conference of the Parties recognized the Bad Ivory Database System (BIDS) established by TRAFFIC for this purpose in 1992.

Through further development and refinement, BIDS evolved into the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS), which has been used to monitor the pattern and scale of illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens since 1998.

#### 2. Data scope

ETIS is a comprehensive and global information system whose central feature is a database holding the details of law enforcement records for seizures or confiscations of elephant ivory and other elephant specimens which have been reported to occur since 1989. ETIS also maintains a series of subsidiary information on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors

The following data relating to seizures of elephant specimens will be collected by Parties and consolidated and analyzed by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, and the MIKE-ETIS TAG:

Irrespective of whether the seizure was made at an international border, or at domestic level for example during the search of a private or business property or during inspections at domestic markets, the following data on all seizures for violations involving ivory and other elephant specimens are collected by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat:

- a) Minimum information relating to each seizure that must be submitted to allow a record to be included in the trend analysis (information required to enable data entry of a seizure case into ETIS):
  - i. source of information
  - ii. date of seizure
  - iii. agency responsible for seizure
  - iv. country of seizure
  - v. type of ivory and quantity
  - vi. type and/or quantity of non-ivory elephant products
- b) Additional trade route information, if available, that informs the modelling (eptional information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of the trade routes and means of transport used, methods of detection as well as the origin and destination of ivory and other elephant specimens):
  - i. country of origin
  - ii. country of export
  - iii. country of transit
  - iv. country of destination/import
- c) Optional information that is used contextually to understand illegal activity (information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of type of illegal activity, transport used, methods of detection and nationality of those involved in illegal trade of ivory and other elephant specimens):
  - i. type of transaction
  - ii. mode of transport
  - iii. *modus operandi*method of detection
  - iv. nationality of suspects

In addition to the seizure data, ETIS-TRAFFIC also maintains a series of subsidiary information, including on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors to enable and inform the statistical analysis and its interpretation. Upon consultation with the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG), the subsidiary data required for analysis and interpretation may be revised and updated, in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, as necessary to improve the analysis and the resulting output and interpretation. Parties will be informed about the additional data elements to be added and its rationale through a Notification and on CITES website.

Parties should validate seizure data relating to their country through ETIS Online or in response to a Notification to be issued by the Secretariat on an annual basis prior to the analysis of the data. TRAFFIC will include seizure data relating to their country in the analysis unless the Party indicates through ETIS Online or within the timeframe as specified in the Notification that the data should not be included.

### 3. Methods Data governance

Data and information on illegal trade in elephant ivory and other elephant specimens will be collected by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat. In this regard, a standardized methodology has been developed for the collection of data, including, inter alia and to the extent known:

- source of information
- date of seizure
- agency responsible for seizure
- type of transaction
- -country of seizure
- country of origin
- country of export
- country of destination/import
- type of ivory and quantity
- mode of transport
- modus operandi

#### - nationality of suspects

Standardized data are collected through a number of mechanisms and formats, including direct online data submission to the ETIS website, using the ETIS Data Collection Form for individual seizure cases or the ETIS Data Collection Spreadsheet for reporting multiple seizure cases at one time. Reporting on elephant product seizures or confiscations using other formats is also acceptable.

### a) Oversight and accountability

The CITES Secretariat is responsible for data governance, in consultation with TRAFFIC. An agreement between the Secretariat and TRAFFIC will formalize the matters associated with data governance as provided for in this Resolution. Data governance will address sensitive and non-sensitive information collected and the use of this data and information, taking into consideration paragraph 27 g) of the Resolution. Information relating to governance will be made available on the ETIS Online system and the CITES website. Roles, responsibilities and accountability of data owners and stewards for all ETIS data are set out below.

#### b) Data ownership

The detailed data on individual seizure cases submitted to ETIS are owned by the respective CITES Parties. Each Party has data ownership accountability over the data submitted by the Party. The CITES Secretariat has data ownership accountability for all other data/information/measures used by TRAFFIC in the ETIS analysis. Data owners are accountable for the quality and integrity of their own data; however, the day-to-day data management activities may be delegated to the data stewards (CITES Secretariat and TRAFFIC).

### c) Data stewardship

Data stewardship is the management of data and information, including content and metadata, on behalf of the data owners to ensure high quality data, required controls and data integrity in accordance with the data scope. The CITES Secretariat is the primary data steward of all ETIS data; all data management responsibilities are delegated to TRAFFIC in terms of the agreement referred to in paragraph 3 a) above.

#### 4. Data collection and compilation

The MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG) will support the development and implementation of ETIS. ETIS will be managed and coordinated by TRAFFIC in consultation with the TAG and in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat.

All Parties, through their CITES Management Authorities, following liaisons with appropriate law enforcement agencies, should provide information on seizures and confiscations of ivory or other elephant specimens in the prescribed formats, either to the Secretariat or directly to TRAFFIC within 90 days of their occurrence or by 31 October each year for the submission of data covering seizures in the preceding year. In addition, law enforcement agencies in States not-party to the Convention are invited to provide similar information.

TRAFFIC will assist the Parties in collecting data, ensuring data quality and consistency, and providing tools and training in data collection, data utilization and information management to designated officials around the world as appropriate.

Standardized data for ETIS will be collected through several mechanisms and formats, including direct online data submission to the ETIS website, using the ETIS Data Collection Form for individual seizure cases or the ETIS Data Collection Excel template for reporting multiple seizure cases at one time. Reporting on elephant specimen seizures or confiscations using the CITES annual illegal trade report is acceptable, but other formats are not recommended.

### 5. Information, data analysis and interpretation

Information generated by ETIS is hereby defined as the outcomes and outputs of ETIS data analysis, including summaries and aggregates in different forms, trends and other analytical presentations, and the relationships and factors which comprise underlying trade dynamics.

Data is hereby defined as the facts gathered through ETIS processes on individual seizures, including those collected using the CITES 'Ivory and elephant product data collection form' or other mechanisms used for obtaining elephant product seizure data. It also includes data that is part of the subsidiary databases within ETIS, and any other data that have been primarily collected under ETIS auspices to facilitate ETIS analyses.

The analysis and interpretation of data will be coordinated by TRAFFIC in association with the CITES Secretariat and MIKE (see Annex 2), and in consultation with the relevant Parties and the TAG. The statistical methodology, underlying code and supporting documentation, including how data is processed, biasadjusted and then used in the ETIS analysis, will be made available to all Parties. The statistical modelling and techniques will be reviewed and refined as deemed necessary by the TAG, TRAFFIC and the CITES Secretariat, and submitted to the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup of the Standing Committee for consideration.

#### 6. Intersessional remedial action

In the event that there is a need for urgent intersessional action, TRAFFIC will report as appropriate to the Standing Committee via the Secretariat.

### 7. Funding

Regular funding should be secured A funding mechanism will be established to ensure that ETIS is fully operational can meet minimum operational requirements to deliver on the objectives in paragraph 27 a) of the Resolution.

The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the following amendment to paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports*:

4. AGREES that, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, data collected in the annual illegal trade report and included in the database should be made available to Parties for research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime as it affects them, and to the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) for ICCWC global research and analysis studies on wildlife and forest crime, and any data related to seizures of on elephant specimens seized (as prepared by the Secretariat) to ETIS to support the monitoring the illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens as provided for in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18);

The Committee agreed that the deadline for submission of ETIS data should be 31 October.

The Committee approved the nomination of Ms Lucy Vigne and Mr Steven Broad as new global members of the MIKE and ETIS TAG, and noted that Dr Jennifer Mailley will be co-opted as a technical expert.

The Committee requested TRAFFIC and the Secretariat to clarify the data aggregates that appear as zero on the ETIS page on the CITES website to distinguish between a country that reported to ETIS that no seizures of elephant specimens occurred and a country that did not report to ETIS.

### Adoption of Executive Summaries

The executive summary of the eighth session in document SC74 Sum. 8 was adopted with the following amendments:

- Under agenda item 34, the text of the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 17.4 on Demand reduction strategies to combat illegal trade in CITES-listed species should include the following:
- 1. URGES Parties where there is a significant market for illegally traded wildlife products to:
  - actively develop and implement well-targeted, species-specific, evidence-based campaigns by engaging key consumer groups and targeting the motivations for the demand, including the speculative nature of the demand, and develop specific messaging approaches and methods for target audiences in order to achieve behaviour change;
- Under agenda item 67, page 7, the sentence before Decision 19.AA should read: "The Committee agreed to submit to CoP19 the draft decisions in Annex 1 to document SC74 Doc. 67.23":

### 87. Any other business

There was no decision taken by the Committee.

### 88. <u>Determination of the time and venue of the 75th and 76th meetings</u>

The Committee <u>noted</u> that its 75th meeting would take place in Panama City, Panama, on 13 November 2022, and that its 76th meeting would be held immediately after the close of CoP19, on 25 November 2022.

### 89. Closing remarks

Following the remarks by members of the Committee, observers representing Parties and intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and the Secretary-General, the Chair thanked France for its warm welcome, all participants for their cooperation and thanked the Secretariat, the interpreters and the French volunteers for their work, and closed the meeting at 18h45.