

### MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT VIET NAM CITES MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY

Viet Nam CITES Management Authority Administration of Forestry Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development T: +842437335676, E: cites vn.kl@mard.gov.vn

Ha Noi,23rd Novemner 2021

Attention to: Johannes Stahl

Secretary of CITES

Regarding: Update on NIAP Progress Report – Viet Nam

Viet Nam CITES Management Authority would like to take this opportunity to express our greetings to the Secretary of CITES.

Regarding to the NIRAP report, Viet Nam have submitted National Iory and Rhino horn action progess Report before 73rd Meeting of CITES Standing Committee to CITES Secretariat.

In Feb 25th 2021 Viet Nam continue to submit some feeedback on NIRAP Progess Report after receving some comment from CITES Secretariat. Please find the attached two those document for your reference.

Since February ultill now, we would like to update some further activities related to NIRAP that we have achived, which include:

- 1. Legislation and Regulations:
- 1.1.The Govervenment of Viet Nam has issue Decree No. 84/2021/NĐ-CP which ammended some articles of Decree No. 06/2019/NĐ-CP on endangered, rare and precious wildlife management and CITES implement. One of the key point of new Decree that, the Government prohibits the sale of CITES specimen after confiscaion.
- 1.2. Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development has submited a Decree to ammend the Decree No. 35/2019/NĐ-CP regulationg Sactions for administrative violation in Forestry sector, the new Decree will be issued in the end of 2021, in which added number of provision related wildlife violation activities.
- 2. National level enforcement action and inter-agency collaboration
- 2.1. An inter-angecies meeting that hosted Viet Nam National Central Bureaus Interpol on strentherning inter-agencies and international against illegal wildlife trade in May 2021.
- 2.2. Around 10 training course, which include online, hybrid and offline were conducted on skills to prevent illegal wildlife trade for enforcement official by the Viet Nam CITES MA, NGOs in last 10 months.

B9 Building, 02 Ngoc Ha Street, Ha Noi, Viet Nam; Tel: (84-24) 37335676, Fax: (84-24) 37346742

Email: cites vn.kl@mard.gov.vn

## CIN

### MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT VIET NAM CITES MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY

- 2.6. Institue of Ecology and Biology resources has issue a techinal guidelines on colleting forensic smaples of ivory, rhino horn in 2021, number of training workshop which conducted by the CITES MA in collaboration with CITES SA for frontline officers during 2021.
- 2.7. With support from US saving species, Standarize guildline for identification and rhino horn was developmed and delivered for frontline officers in 2021.
- 3. International, regional law enforcement cooperation
- 3.2. In June 2021, the Viet Nam CITES MA have handover 56 rhinor horn DAN samples from 02 conficated cases to South Africa embassy in Hanoi to stherngthen the cooperation between two countries to against illegal trade on rhino specimen.
- 4. Awareness raising and public education
- 4.5. With the support from US Saving species project (USAID), a survey on consumer demands, consumer behaviour on reducing demand for ivory and rhino horns conducted.
- 5. Communication and report
- 5.1. nforcement agencies, adjudication agencies all have databases of arrests and penalties for wildlife law violators. In addition, there is coordination of NGOs such as WCS, ENV... in maintaining and monitoring these databases.

In other hand, Viet Nam would like to inform that, since January 2021 up to now, Enforcement agnecies Viet Nam have investigated and confiscated one case of illegal trade on rhino horn. In 18th July 2021, 138kg of rhino horn was seized in Danang sea post, this is result of international and inter-agencies cooperation, the subjects involved are criminal procesecuted.

Yours sincerely,

**Viet Nam CITES Management Authority** 

B9 Building, 02 Ngoc Ha Street, Ha Noi, Viet Nam; Tel: (84-24) 37335676, Fax: (84-24) 37346742

Email: cites vn.kl@mard.gov.vn



### MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT VIET NAM CITES MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY

Viet Nam CITES Management Authority Administration of Forestry Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development T: +842437335676, E: cites vn.kl@mard.gov.vn

Ha Noi, Feb 25th 2021

Attention to: Johannes Stahl

Secretary of CITES

Regarding: Feedbacks on NIAP Progress Report – Viet Nam

Viet Nam CITES Management Authority would like to take this opportunity to express our greetings to the Secretary of CITES.

In response to the Assessment of NIAP Progress of Viet Nam since 2013, Vietnam CITES Management Authority (CTVN) would like to provide further updates and comments regarding particular actions, thus expect the Secretariat to reconsider the assessment upon factual data and contexts, as following:

- 1. Viet Nam welcomes the general comments made by Secretariat on the collective efforts made by the country upon achieving their NIRAP as well as the endeavor to eradicate illegal wildlife trade. Under the complex context of Covid-19 that resulted in extreme hardwork during the passed year, wildlife trade has been paid attention to than ever before. The Prime Minister of Viet Nam has issued Decision 29/CT-TTg on 23/7/2020 on emergent actions to control wildlife trade, that prohibits the import of animals (except for a number of purposes or special cases). The acts will be continued to be enforced until further notice.
- 2. Regarding action 2.6 Technical guidelines on collection forensic sample: in collaboration with Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources Viet Nam (IEBR, Viet Nam CITES Scientific Authority), one of the major collectors and forensic test units on frequently traded species to Viet Nam (elephants, rhinos, pangolins, big cats), the guidelines has been endorsed by IEBR to broadly used within the country. We expect that no further progress should be made given the current one already achieved our objectives and current context. Viet Nam therefore suggest the rating to be "Achieved".
- 3. Regarding action 2.8 Training for law enforcement agencies: in cooperation with USAID, a consolidated and comprehensive set of training curriculum materials for enforcement agencies has been completed, including materials for supreme court, environmental polices, customs and forest rangers officers. The curriculum is tailored to correspond with speciality of each working area, still, built upon a general background that constitute a set of training materials. Viet Nam, hence, believe this rating should be "Achieved".

B9 Building, 02 Ngoc Ha Street, Ha Noi, Viet Nam; Tel: (84-24) 37335676, Fax: (84-24) 37346742

# CIE

## MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT VIET NAM CITES MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY

- 4. Regarding action 3.1 and 3.2 Exchange information with countries in ASEAN-WEN and MoU signatories, and information exchange with African countries: the year of the pandemic has considerably hindered international cooperation that requires working visits or similar actions. Subjecting to the implementation of MLAT among countries, on which multiple requests from Viet Nam has been sent to Mozambique during last years, we are still expecting to improvements on mutual feedbacks. Under the signed agreement, Viet Nam and Mozambique have assigned their focal units as official information exchange units on MLAT. We are thus not in the condition to seek for assistance from other organizations. Given the Treaty on MLAT between Viet Nam and Mozambique has been newly and officially signed on 11/9/2020, we expect this will allow progress in near future. Viet Nam suggests the rating as "Substantially achieved".
- 5. Regarding action 4.1 National extra-curricular training curriculum: the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, in cooperation with Ministry of Education and Training, under support by Humane Society International, has developed a training curriculum titling "Education on conservation on threatened species for primary schools". The curriculum is within the authority of Ministry of Education and Training to endorse at national scale. Following pilot phases during 2018, 2019, the curriculum inclusive of 10 books, 09 subjects, was approved by the Ministry of Education and Training on 22/8/2019 to be used in extra-curricular lessons at national scale. The materials were distributed to localities in digital and hard copies. Viet Nam therefore request to re-assess this as "Achieved".
- 6. Regarding action 4.3 and action 4.5- Surveys on consumer demand and market:

In cooperation with USAID, a survey of domestic demand for rhino horn, ivory, pangolin products had been conducted as baseline survey report for further demand reduction outreach. The report's findings provided a critical baseline that identifies the characteristics of rhino horn, ivory, and pangolin current and potential users in Vietnam and enabled tailored Social Behavior Change Communications (SBCC) campaigns to be developed for these user groups. The survey findings not only provided insights of consumers/buyers' motivations to buy each product, but also revealed demographic features of the consumers/buyer and methods to reach and influence them to reduce the demand and consumption.

Basing on this information, the project had developed and implemented three large social behavioral change communications (SBCC) campaigns to stop illegal wildlife trafficking, including:

- The communications campaign designed to raise public awareness of the legal penalties for wildlife crimes (fines and incarceration);
- The SBCC campaign designed to address consumers' emotional motivations of the use of pangolin and ivory;
- The SBCC campaign designed to address consumers' functional use motivations related to the use of pangolin and rhino horn.

B9 Building, 02 Ngoc Ha Street, Ha Noi, Viet Nam; Tel: (84-24) 37335676, Fax: (84-24) 37346742



## MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT VIET NAM CITES MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY

Therefore, it is clearly recognized that the survey's report was a critical input to the development and implementation of follow-up outreach activities, contributing to the efforts on awareness raising and public education in Viet Nam.

For more information about the Baseline survey report, please click <u>here</u>; about the SBCC campaigns, please click <u>here</u>.

Viet Nam, consequently, advises the rating of these two actions (4.3 and 4.5) to be "Achieved".

- 7. Regarding action 5.1 on National database: the National database along with an E-permit system is currently under development in cooperation with USAID. CTVN expects the basic platform to be completed by Quarter 2, 2021. Viet Nam suggest this to be rated as "Substaintially achieved".
- 8. Regarding action 5.2 Reporting, ETIS, stockpile: the latest Stockpile report of Viet Nam was submitted by July 2020, inclusive of both 2019 and 2020 data, along with Annex 1. Ivory confiscation, Annex 2. Ivory destruction. We therefore believe this action to be
- 9. As the Viet Nam NIRAP was endorsed to be implemented in 03 years from 2018 to 2020, there is a small proportion of actions under self-assessment to be "Substantially achieved" (03/25 actions 12%). Meanwhile, 88% of actions (22/25 actions) have been achieved considering the self-assessment, updates and justification. Viet Nam agrees that further actions might be made to pursue sustainable wildlife trade, that ivory and rhinoceros horn trafficking is much a global issue requesting inter-continental collaboration. We pledge to support this endeavor with possible measures. However, given the time frame of the NIRAP is limited (2018-2020) and the majority of achieved actions, Viet Nam kindly request an overall re-assessment as "Subtantially achieved". The partially-completed actions will be continued to be implemented under corresponding manners.

CTVN appreciate the work done by the Secretariat on the work of NIAP implementation, and trust that you will continue to work with us for the improvement of an international collective efforts. We are at your disposal for further information or clarification./.

Yours sincerely,

considered as "Achieved".

Viet Nam CITES Management Authority

B9 Building, 02 Ngoc Ha Street, Ha Noi, Viet Nam; Tel: (84-24) 37335676, Fax: (84-24) 37346742



## CITES NATIONAL IVORY AND RHINO HORN ACTION PLAN PROGESS REPORT

Document submitted to the  $73^{\rm rd}$  meeting of the CITES Standing Committee

-----

Party: VIET NAM

Report period: 2018 - 2020

-----

#### Part A: Summary of NIRAP implementation in 2018-2020

National Ivory and Rhinoceros horn Action Plan (NIRAP) for the period 2018 – 2020 in Viet Nam was developed to implement urgent measures to (1) control illegal trade in ivory and rhinoceros horn in and out of Viet Nam (2) continue to implement the approved initiatives, programs, and plans to prevent progress toward illegal trade in wildlife specimens in general and rhinoceros horn and ivory in particular, according to the Prime Minister's Directive No. 28/CT-TTg. The NIRAP plan firstly aims to implement the Prime Minister's Directive, the Criminal Code of the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam, the Law on Penalties for Administrative Violations, and legal documents in the field of forest protection and development and implementation of CITES.

After 23 months of implementation of the Plan, most of the activities have been completed, archieved 96% of target. Specifically:

- Completed the legal framework related to the control of trade in wild fauna and flora, including ivory and rhinoceros horn, as in Decree No. 06/2019/ND-CP dated January 22, 2019 of the Government on the management of endangered, precious and rare forest fauna and flora and implementation of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora; Decree No. 35/2019/ND-CP dated April 25, 2019 on penalties for administrative violations against regulations on forestry; Circular No. 27/2018/TT-BNNPTNT dated November 16, 2018 of the Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development on prescribing the management and traceability of forest products; Circular No. 29/2019/TT-BNNPTNT dated December 31, 2019 of the Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development on stipulating the handling of forest animals being exhibits and forest animals voluntarily submitted to the State by individuals and organizations; Directive No. 28/CT-TTg of the Prime Minister on urgent solutions for preventing and combating the illegal violation of wild fauna. The above documents have been effective in combating and preventing illegal trade and transportation of wildlife.
- Strengthened law enforcement capacity, strengthened intersectoral coordination through the organization of 35 training courses to strengthen capacity and skills for professional work and technique from investigations, prosecutions and trial with related crimes; other skills in identifying samples for customs officers and border guards at the northern border gates; effective application of new provisions of the amended Criminal Code 2015 and corresponding penalty framework; and joint activities of VN-WEN network. Immediately after the Criminal Code came into effect, Viet Nam's procedural agencies Vietnam has resumed investigating, prosecuting and adjudicating cases that were previously not handled, due to the lack of specific quantitative regulations which now explicitly legislated to handle it strictly. In the period of 2018-2020, on ivory and rhinoceros horn, the Customs detected and arrested 17 cases, including 10 cases of ivory and 7 cases of rhinoceros horn, criminally prosecuted 01 case, continuing to investigate 16 cases; border guards took the lead in detecting and arresting 02 cases, 03 subjects, confiscated 53.8 kg of ivory and

coordinated with Customs to arrest 01 case and confiscated 9,123 kg of ivory (figures related to ivory and rhinoceros horn are included in the Appendix).

The court has handled a total of 251 criminal cases on violations of regulations on the protection of wild, endangered, precious and rare animals, including 362 defendants, of which, 20 cases, 25 defendants have been filed with the Procuracy, 210 cases and 292 defendants were tried; penalties applied to the accused during the trial include: 02 fines, 06 non-custodial reform sentences, 137 suspended sentences, 83 imprisonment sentences of 3 years or less, 39 imprisonment sentences of over 3 years to 7 years, and 25 imprisonment sentences from over 7 years to 15 years. For example, in the judgment No. 29/2020/HS-ST of May 13, 2020 of the People's Court of Lao Cai city, three subjects, Duong Van Chiem, Duong Van Sang and Duong Van Thanh, were sentenced for transporting 13 rhinoceros horns specimens (pieces and horns), respectively, 8 years 6 months in prison, 7 years 3 months in prison and 7 years in prison.

These are clear evidences of the determination of the Government of Viet Nam in combating the illegal trade of wildlife in general and ivory and rhinoceros horn in particular.

- In the period of 2018-2020, Viet Nam has also completed technical guidance on sampling procedures for ivory, rhinoceros horn and pangolin inspection in accordance with national and international regulations.
- Efforts to address domestic and foreign market demand in Viet Nam for ivory and rhinoceros horn products. Efforts to address domestic and foreign market demand in Viet Nam for ivory and rhinoceros horn products. These activities include conducting a survey of domestic demand for ivory and rhinoceros horn; on that base, propaganda has been conducted for different stakeholders to reduce demand based on scientific and practical researches. The goals of demand reduction aim towards raising social awareness in parallel with behavior change, in which, not only focusing on a number of target groups such as health, enterprises, tourism and services, but also giving special focus to the awareness education for students.
- Intersectoral steering committee for the law enforcement on prevention and control of illegal wildlife trade (Viet Nam-WEN) has been operating step by step with high efficiency. Through at least one annual meeting, the Viet Nam-WEN Steering Committee agreed on effective coordination methods and set out priority activities to be carried out in the year. The data of arrest, prosecution, and trial activities has also been shared appropriately, serving the assessment of the situation and the development of appropriate implementation plans.
- Promote bilateral and multilateral cooperation and cooperation among source transition destination countries and between governmental agencies and non-governmental organizations, international organizations to strengthen control and enhance law enforcement. In 2018, Viet Nam signed a Treaty on Mutual Legal in Criminal Matters Republic of Mozambique and has now completed procedures to ratify this Treaty.

- Strengthen coordination with government and non-government organizations in combating illegal wildlife trade. Typically, the Viet Nam Environmental Police Department collaborated with WJC (Netherlands) to investigate, arrest, prosecute at least 3 cases of illegally storing and transporting ivory and rhinoceros horn. For example, the arrest of Pham Van Quyet for transporting over 200 kg of ivory (16 pieces) in Hoang Mai District, Hanoi on June 27, 2019.
- Maintain the implementation of CITES member state obligations responsibly by collecting information, preparing and sending periodic reports to CITES upon request.

Therefore, comparing with the goals and plans set out in the NIRAP action plan, Viet Nam has successfully completed its progress. Specifically, out of 25 activities in the Plan, by June 2020, the progress of completing the activities is as follows:

No	Implementation progress assessment	Number of activities	Percentage (%)
1	Achieved	22	88%
2	Subtantially achieved	1	4%
3	On track	1	4%
4	Partial progress	0	0%
5	Pending complention of another action	1	4%
6	Not commenced	0	0%
	Total	25	100%

Statistically, currently, only 01 activity has not been completed because this activity is related to many different sectors (such as survey data from the police forces under the Ministry of Public Security, the border guards under the Ministry of National Defense, ranger under the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Customs under the Ministry of Finance, etc.) and deployed by these forces across the country, while a number of regulations on the process of investigation and prosecution is also a legal barrier that prevents this activity from being implemented in a short time. With the above progress summary, Viet Nam self-assesses the level of plan completion plan as 96%. Viet Nam believes that the combat against wildlife crimes, especially the criminal groups in ivory and rhinoceros horn illegal trade, is long-term, requiring the close attention and coordination of source and transition countries because crime activities are being organized tightly with increasing sophistication and complexity. If only a single country takes the action, with the lack of information networks, cooperation between countries, this activity will be inefficient. Viet Nam law enforcement forces have dismantled large quantities of ivory originating from Africa into Viet Nam (before the shipment arrived in Viet Nam) as a clear demonstration of the determination, efforts of Viet Nam law enforcement agencies.

#### Part B: SUMMARY EVALUATION OF ACTIONS (ASSIGNED PROGRESS RATINGS)

	PROGRESS RATING						
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	
1. Legal framework and legal documents	1.1. Develop the Decree on endangered, rare and precious wildlife management and CITES implementation.  1.2. Amend the Decree on Sanctions for administrative violations on management, development, protection of forest and forest products.  1.3. Develop a decree regulating the exploitation of forest products, lawful files of forest products and management of forest products origin, files of traceability and marking of specimens of forest						
2. National level law enforcement and inter- agency collaboration	plants and animals.  2.1 Cooperate, exchange information on VN-WEN network.  2.2. Hands-on training of environmental police on investigation techniques.  2.3 Environmental police department to carry out 02 investigations in the area to strengthen control on wildlife crime						

	PROGRESS RATING						
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	
	in hotspot areas.  2.4 Forest protection departments, interdisciplinary agencies to cooperate to carry out a range of investigation at souvenir shops, processing workshops that are likely to be involved with wildlife crime in hotspot areas.  2.5. Survey, report, recommendation, and solution in controlling online illegal wildlife trade, cyber-crime on social media.  2.6. Develop technical guidelines on collecting forensic samples of ivory, rhino horns and training for forensic officers to use the guidelines.  2.7. Standardize and publicize guideline documents for identification of ivory and rhino horn specimens, specifically for front-line law enforcement officer at border gate, in checking processing workshop, hand luggage, jewelries of tourist.  2.8. Training workshops for law enforcement agencies to strengthen						

	PROGRESS RATING						
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	
	their CITES implementation capacity using specifically designed curriculums suitable for each group.  2.9. Training on the amended Penal Code 2015, related to the crime of trade, transport, possession of ivory and rhinoceros horns for law enforcement officers.  2.10. Training courses to raise awareness of judiciary officials on the seriousness of wildlife crimes, particularly ivory and rhino horn offences.  2.11. Development of a quick-reference pocket guide for law enforcement officers on application of the revised wildlife crime under the new Penal Code, including ivory and rhino horn offences.						
3. Coordinating law enforcement at regional and international	3.1 Continuous exchange of information on seizures within ASEAN-WEN countries or joint-training among countries who signed MoU with Viet Nam.  3.2. Collaborate with source countries (Africa) to exchange						

	PROGRESS RATING							
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced		
levels	information on solutions to improve the effectiveness of criminal legal assistance; To actively support the implementation of criminal legal assistance requests in order to respond to the investigation, prosecution and adjudication of criminal cases related to wildlife; Promoting the negotiation and signing of bilateral criminal legal assistance agreements between Vietnam and African countries.  3.3. Cooperate with nongovermental and international organizations in receiving, transferring, processing information of early warning, arrests, suspects and other information.							
4. Awareness raising and public education	4.1. National extra-curricular training curriculum on the protection, conservation of prioritized wildlife animals for elementary school students.  4.2. Incorporate issues on protection, conservation of prioritized wild species in the reformed national curriculum for							

	PROGRESS RATING						
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	
	general education.  4.3. Surveys on consumer demands, consumer behaviors domestic market of ivory and rhinoceros horns.  4.4. Outreach of demand reduction for ivory and rhino horns among international tourists to Viet Nam.  4.5. Survey on consumer demands, consumer behaviors on reducing demand for ivory and rhino horns to business groups.  4.6. Raise public awareness on the protection and conservation of wildlife in general and ivory and rhinoceros horn in particular.						
5. Information and report		5.2. The international reporting and information systems include the Elephant Species Information System (ETIS), the rhinoceros specimen			5.1. National database system of illegal trade, transport, possession and related cases, from seizures, prosecution, convictions.		

	PROGRESS RATING						
ACTIVITIES	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	
		storage report, the annual national report.					

**Part C: DETAILED EVALUATION OF ACTIONS** 

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS				
1. Legislation and Regulations							
1.1. Develop the Decree on endangered, rare and precious wildlife management and CITES implementation	Indicator: New Decree incorporate the contents on species lists, management scheme, regulations on CITES implementation, marking, traceability to address gaps in domestic legislation in comparison to international requirements	Achieved	• The GoV has issued Decree no. 06/2019/ND-CP dated 22/01/2019 on endangered, rare and precious wildlife management and CITES implementation. Decree took effect as of 10/3/2019. This Decree replaced for the Decree no. 32/2006/ND-CP and Decree no. 82/2006/ND-CP.				
1.2. Amend the Decree on Sanctions for administrative violations on management, development, protection of forest and forest products	Indicator: the Decree is amended with relevant contents	Achieved	• The GoV has issued Decree no. 35/2019/ND-CP dated 25/4/2019 regulating Sanctions for administrative violations in the field of forestry sector, took effect as of 10/6/2019. This Decree replaced for the Decree no. 157/2013/ND-CP to unify the Sanctions for administrative violations and the sanctions according to the provisions of the Penal Code.				
1.3. Develop a decree regulating the exploitation of forest products, lawful files of forest products and management of forest products origin, files of traceability and marking of specimens of forest plants and animals	Indicator: Circular is issued by Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development	Achieved	<ul> <li>MARD has issued Circular no. 27/2018/TT-BNNPTNT dated 16/11/2018 of Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) regulates the management and traceability of forest products. Circular took effect as of 01/01/2019.</li> <li>Out of the three activities mentioned above, the Government has issued the Decree no. 26/2019/ND-CP dated 08/3/2019 detailing a number of articles and measures to enforce Fisheries law; The Supreme People's</li> </ul>				

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMEN'	Т	PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS
			Court of Vietnam has issued Resolution No. 05/2018/NQ-HDTP dated 05/11/2018 providing guidelines for application of the Penal Code on crimes of wildlife protection; Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development has signed to issue the Circular no. 29/2019/TT-BNNPTNT dated 31/12/2019 on handling of forest animals being exhibits and forest animals voluntarily submitted to the State by individuals and organizations.
2. National level enforcement	action and inter-agency collabo	pration	
2.1. Cooperate, exchange information on VN-WEN network	Indicator: 01 - 02 meeting organized annually, information exchange to allow Viet Nam CITES MA generate a unified, official and national database about the illegal wildlife trade, especially ivory and rhino horn	Achieved	<ul> <li>Organized 02 Vietnam-WEN meeting to discuss information sharing mechanism on May 2018 and March 2019</li> <li>Organized 01 Vietnam-WEN meeting on February 2020 to review activities stated in the National Ivory and Rhino Action Plan (NIRAP) and follow up plan to combat illegal wildlife trafficking, focusing on into ivory and rhino horn</li> <li>Information sharing mechanism is more effective (sharing trial cases, arrests, etc.)</li> </ul>
2.2. Hands-on training of environmental police on investigation techniques	Indicator: number of police officers trained	Achieved	Organized 06 training courses for 150 environmental police officers on CITES implementation and Wildlife Crime Investigation.
2.3. Environmental police department to carry out 02 investigations in the area to strengthen control on wildlife crime in hotspot areas	Indicator: basic investigation report in the area	Achieved	• Conducted 02 investigations in some in hotspot areas of Vietnam, including 01 investigation at Tien Sa port, Da Nang city (a main area for wildlife trade), discovered and confiscated 9,123 kg of ivory in March; 01 investigation in Hai Ba Trung district, Ha Noi city, confiscated 29

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMEN	Т	PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS
			ivory pieces, arrested 03 suspects in June 2019.
2.4.Forest protection departments, interdisciplinary agencies to cooperate to carry out a range of investigation at souvenir shops, processing workshops that are likely to be involved with wildlife crime in hotspot areas	Indicator: investigation report	Achieved	<ul> <li>Forest protection departments cooperated with Environmental Police Department and relevant law enforcement agencies to launch the Ivory Campaign on the Vietnam-China border.</li> <li>Forest protection agencies cooperated with Hanoi Municipal Police Department to check processing workshops in Phu Khe, Thuong Tin, Ha Noi in June and July 2018.</li> <li>The Steering Committee 1389 of the Defense Ministry cooperated with the Forest protection agencies and local authorities to organize 12 groups of inspectors to check the fight against smuggling and trade frauds in key areas.</li> <li>On June 2019, Forest protection departments checked 01 handicrafts shop in Tu Son district, Bac Ninh province and identified the shop owner illegal stored 0.6kg of products processed from ivory.</li> </ul>
2.5.Survey, report, recommendation, and solution in controlling online illegal wildlife trade, cyber-crime on social media	Indicator: increased level of information exchange and interaction with cyber-crime police department.	Achieved	<ul> <li>Collecting information online to detect illegal wildlife trade websites.</li> <li>Completed the report on reviewing the wildlife trade status via Internet in Vietnam on April 2020, in which recognized that the online wildlife trade activities are increasing and changing continuously. Therefore, it is needed to promote multi-solutions to effectively manage online wildlife trade, such as to develop communication campaign toward related subjects including companies, individuals involving in transportation and delivery online; supplement legal regulations and policies to strengthen the effective management; to speed up</li> </ul>

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMEN'	Т		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS
				collaboration among law enforcement agencies.
2.6.Develop technical guidelines on collecting forensic samples of ivory, rhino horns and training for forensic officers to use the guidelines	Indicator: 01 technical guidelines issued / recommended considering CITES guidelines in Resolution 9.14 (Rev CoP14)	Achieved	•	Vietnam CITES MA has cooperated with Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources (IEBR), Humane Society International to finalize the development of technical guidelines on collecting forensic samples of ivory, rhino horns according to technical guidelines of CITES and current national regulations. This activity was completed on December 2019 and is waiting approval of Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development.
2.7.Standardize and publicize guideline documents for identification of ivory and rhino horn specimens, specifically for front-line law enforcement officer at border gate, in checking processing workshop, hand luggage, jewelries of tourist	Indicator: 01 materials recommended by management authorities and provided for relevant parties, number of guidelines incorporated	Achieved	•	Documents for identification of ivory and rhino horn specimens have been developed and circulated at the training courses for front-line law enforcements at border gate
2.8.Training workshops for law enforcement agencies to strengthen their CITES implementation capacity using specifically designed curriculums suitable for each group	Indicator: 01 training curriculum for law enforcement groups adapted to local practice; number of officers participate in workshops	Achieved	•	In the period 2018-2020, Vietnam CITES MA has organized more than 20 training courses on CITES implementation and combating wildlife trade and on disseminating legal knowledge related to the wildlife protection for the officers of Border Guard, Customs, Environmental Police, Fisheries Resources Surveillance, Forest Rangers, Coast Guard, Fisheries Management Agencies, etc.
2.9.Training on the amended Penal Code 2015, related to	Indicator: number of officers participate the training	Achieved	•	Organized 15 training courses on Penal Code for the law enforcement officers including Customs, Police, Forest

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMEN	Т	PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS
the crime of trade, transport, possession of ivory and rhinoceros horns for law enforcement officers	workshop.		rangers, border guard on the legal regulations in controlling wildlife trade. 750 officers have been trained.
2.10.Training courses to raise awareness of judiciary officials on the seriousness of wildlife crimes, particularly ivory and rhino horn offences	Indicator: Number of convicted cases with penal sanctions	Achieved	<ul> <li>The Supreme People's Court (SPC), in collaboration with UNODC, with the assistance of the GIG USAID Project and the Saving Species project has organized 05 training courses for judges from 63 provinces and cities across the country on violations of regulations on forestry and wildlife protection, focusing on illegal trade in ivory and rhino horn. 230 judges have been trained.</li> <li>Supported to develop draft of resolution of Judicial Council and consultation activities to contribute comments to the Resolution. On 05/11/2018, SPC's Judicial Council issued Resolution no. 05/2018/NQ-HDTP guiding the application of Article 234 on wildlife crimes and Article 244 on crimes on precious and rare animal protection of the Penal Code</li> </ul>
2.11.Development of a quick-reference pocket guide for law enforcement officers on application of the revised wildlife crime under the new Penal Code, including ivory and rhino horn offences.	Indicator: 01 pocket guide to be disseminated to law enforcement officers	Achieved	<ul> <li>Agencies under Ministry of Natural Resources         Environment, in collaboration with UNODC organized         the collection of comments on the Draft of Handbook on         technical guidelines to identify environmental crimes.         Comments of 158 environmental inspectors and police         officers were collected. The handbook has been         completed and circulated to relevant partners.     </li> </ul>
3. International, regional law			
3.1. Continuous exchange of information on seizures	Indicator: number of information exchanges	Achieved	Vietnam CITES MA regularly exchanges seizures with ASEAN countries and countries that have signed

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS		
within ASEAN-WEN countries or joint-training among countries who signed MoU with Viet Nam	including data on seizures, prosecution, conviction, forensic test		memorandums of understanding with Vietnam, such as exchanging with Indonesia the case of 322 Red Lory parrots captured at the Noi Bai airport; exchanged with the South Africa about rhino horn seizures, especially cooperated with Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources on December 2019 to carry out the handover of 55 inspection samples of rhino horn to the representative of South Africa CITES MA.  • The CITES enforcement agencies in Vietnam frequently have professional exchange with the regional and international agencies, especially Customs agencies, which often share information with Customs intelligence of other countries.		
3.2. Collaborate with source countries (Africa) to exchange information on solutions to improve the effectiveness of criminal legal assistance; To actively support the implementation of criminal legal assistance requests in order to respond to the investigation, prosecution and adjudication of criminal cases related to wildlife; Promoting the negotiation and signing of bilateral criminal legal assistance agreements between Vietnam and African countries	Indicator: The number of cases is exchanged legal assistance information	Achieved	<ul> <li>In 2018, Supreme People's Procuracy (SPP) of Vietnam hosted in collaboration with related Ministries and sectors to organize the negotiation and successfully signed the Agreement on Criminal legal assistance with Mozambique. At present, SPP is processing the endorsement of this Agreement.</li> <li>From 2015 to 2018, SPP sent 8 requests of Criminal legal assistance related to ivory trade, particularly: 02 requests to China, 02 requests to Nigeria, 02 requests to Mozambique, 01 request to Laos and 01 request to Malaysia, however, only 2 responses have been received.</li> <li>From 2018 to June 2020: SPP received and handled 4 legal assistance requests from Competent procedural authorities of Vietnam to send oversea (China, Nigeria, Cambodia, Mozambique) and 04 request from foreign authorities to Vietnam (France, Kenya, Mozambique, Poland). The requests are mainly to verify, collect</li> </ul>		

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT			PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS	
				document and evidence, in which, Vietnam handled 2 requests for oversea, 01 request has been partially fulfilled, 01 request sent oversea to provide more information however, the requested additional document has not been received so far. For the request of Vietnam sent oversea, the results of legal assistance requests have not been received.	
3.3. Cooperate with non-governmental and international organizations in receiving, transferring, processing information of early warning, arrests, suspects and other information	Indicator: The number of receiving information and arrests made from sufficient quality information	Achieved		Police and customs authorities have received and processing information from several local and international non-governmental organizations to serve investigations and arrests. Typically, the environmental police department of Vietnam cooperated with Wildlife Justice Commission (WJC) - an international foundation with headquarters in the Netherlands, to share information and arrest, investigate, and prosecute at least 3 cases illegally storing and transporting ivory and rhino horn (For privacy reasons, it is not possible to disclose specific information of these organizations).	
4. Awareness raising and pub	lic education				
4.1. National extracurricular training curriculum on the protection, conservation of prioritized wildlife animals for elementary school students	Indicator: Extracurricular programs approved by the Ministry of Education and Training to recommend for national application	Achieved	•	Vietnam CITES MA in collaboration with Department of Political Education and Student Affairs (Ministry of Education and Training), Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources, with the support of HSI, has successfully developed a set of training curriculum on protection and conservation of wildlife for elementary students nationwide.	
4.2. Incorporate issues on protection, conservation of	Indicator: Extracurricular program is approved by the	Achieved	•	Vietnam CITES MA cooperated with the Department of Education and Training of provinces / cities to	

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS		
prioritized wild species in the reformed national curriculum for general education	National Assembly and applied nationwide		successfully organize 07 events/propaganda competitions to reduce demand for rhinoceros horn in major provinces and cities in Vietnam, including Hanoi city, Ho Chi Minh city, Da Nang city, Hai Phong city, Nha Trang city and Can Tho city		
4.3. Surveys on consumer demands, consumer behaviors domestic market of ivory and rhinoceros horns	Indicator: Survey report towards changing consumption habits in demand reduction propaganda programs	Achieved	<ul> <li>In May 2020, Vietnam CITES MA established an intersectoral survey team consisting of representatives from the Supreme People's Procuracy, the Supreme People's Court, the Ministry of National Defense, the Ministry of Public Security, the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources to conduct a survey on the cooperation situation in control of illegal wildlife trade, focusing primarily on ivory and rhinoceros horn; simultaneously, the team investigated the demand for ivory and rhinoceros horn products in 3 provinces/cities: Lao Cai, Hai Phong and Da Nang.</li> <li>Besides, USAID Wildlife Asia cooperates with TRAFFIC to conduct a survey on the demand for ivory and rhinoceros horn products in some big cities annually.</li> </ul>		
4.4. Outreach of demand reduction for ivory and rhino horns among international tourists to Viet Nam	Indicator: number of tourists having access to propaganda	Achieved	Vietnam CITES MA cooperated with the Vietnam     National Administration of Tourism, the Tourism     Association of Quang Ninh province to complete a report     on the demand of wildlife for 550 international tourists in     Quang Ninh, Da Nang and Khanh Hoa; constructed 02     propaganda billboards on stopping the wildlife trade in     restaurants, hotels in Ha Long tourism area; placed     propaganda posters on stopping the wildlife trade in     restaurants, hotels in Ha Long tourism area; successfully		

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS		
			organized the Conference "Sustainable Tourism - The role of tourism in the combat against illegal wildlife trade".		
4.5. Survey on consumer demands, consumer behaviors on reducing demand for ivory and rhino horns to business groups.	Indicator: number of business/business-person received communication messages	On track	Currently, Vietnam CITES MA is deploying communication on mass media such as television, newspapers, airports, etc.		
4.6. Raise public awareness on the protection and conservation of wildlife in general and ivory and rhinoceros horn in particular	Indicator: number of propagandas on mass media (newspaper, radio) and other forms of propaganda conducted.	Achieved	<ul> <li>Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development held a         Conference to announce the One-year Review of         progress on proposed actions in the Hanoi Statement on         the Illegal Wildlife Trade on May 2018. The information         has been widely published with national and international         media;</li> <li>Vietnam announced its commitment at the London         Conference on the Illegal Wildlife Trade on October         2018. The information has been widely published with         national and international media;</li> <li>Vietnam CITES MA attended the UK Festival in the area         of Natural Village to propagate about law enforcement in         the combat against illegal trade of wild fauna and flora in         Hanoi on November 2018 with thousands of attendees.</li> <li>Vietnam CITES MA and USAID Saving Species (USS)         supported the propaganda activities on the online         business system of Vietnam E-Commerce Association         (VECOM) to raise awareness and responsibility of online         businesses as well as customers about not consuming         illegal wildlife.</li> </ul>		
			The project supported training activities for tourism		

ACTIVITIES	ASSESSMENT		PROGRESS & OTHER COMMENTS	
			companies, tour guides on the situation of illegal wildlife trade and consumption as well as the legal regulations and recommended responsibility in companies and tour guides to guide tourists not to participate or to violate.  More than 170 tour guides, hotel managers and tours have been trained with the support of USS.	
5. Communication and report	t			
5.1. National database system of illegal trade, transport, possession and related cases, from seizures, prosecution, convictions	Indicator: Information is updated regularly, statistical reports are made every year	Pending completion of another action	Deployment stopped due to barriers from national law in sharing and publicizing information on arrest, prosecution and adjudication	
5.2. The international reporting and information systems include the Elephant Species Information System (ETIS), the rhinoceros specimen storage report, the annual national report	Indicator: Information and reports are updated, collected from relevant agencies by Vietnam CITES MA and sent to CITES Secretariat periodically.	Substantially achieved	<ul> <li>Vietnam CITES MA has completed:</li> <li>Submit reports on the storage of rhinoceros specimens to the Secretariat;</li> <li>Provide data for the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS) in accordance with the regulation on arrest of ivory specimens over 500 kg;</li> <li>Annual national report is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2019.</li> </ul>	

#### **Part D: Appendix (enclosed information)**

#### Group 1: Legal framework and legal provisions

Decree numbered 06/2019/ND-CP dated 22/01/2019 of Government, on the management of endangered, precious and rare plants and animals and the implementation of the Convention on International Trade in wildlife, effective from 10/3/2019 (Vietnamese version for reference <a href="here">here</a>).

Decree numbered 35/2019/ND-CP dated 25/04/2019 of Government, stipulating penalties for administrative violations in the forestry sector, effective from 10/6/2019 (Vietnamese version for reference here).

Decree numbered 26/2019/ND-CP dated 08/3/2019 of Government, detailing a number of articles and measures for implementation of the Fisheries Law, effective from 25/4/2019 (Vietnamese version for reference here).

Circular numbered 27/2018/TT-BNNPTNT dated 16/11/2018 of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, providing for management and traceability of forest products, effective from January 1, 2019. (Vietnamese version for reference here).

Circular numbered 29/2019/TT-BNNPTNT dated 31/12/2019 of the Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development, signing the regulation on handling of animals being exhibits; animals that are voluntarily handed over to the State by organizations and individuals, effective from 20/02/2020 (Vietnamese version for reference here).

Resolution numbered 05/2018/NQ-HDTP guiding the application of the Penal Code on violations of wildlife protection, dated 5/11/2018 (Vietnamese version for reference here)

## Group 2: Law enforcement actions at national level and interdisciplinary coordination

Activity 2.4: Some images of illegal ivory trade arresting



Figure 1: Border guards arrest ivory transporters in Cao Bang province in December 2018.



Figure 2 (photo source: Nguyen Son): Danang authorities searched the illegal shipment of ivory for 9,124kg. Video of the incident can be viewed at the link: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pVttbv765lk">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pVttbv765lk</a>



Figure 3 (photo source: Hanoi City Police): The functional forces arrested the smugglers and 55 rhino horns illegally transported to Noi Bai airport in March 2019.



Figure 4 (photo source: Customs newspaper): the functional forces in Mong Cai City, Quang Ninh Province, arrested two people transporting 3,155 kg of rhino horn to China.



Figure 5 (photo source: Customs Newspaper): functional forces at Can Tho airport arrested Do Thanh Son and 11 rhino horn specimens with total weight of more than 28.7kg illegally imported 2/20/2020. The case has now been criminally prosecuted and tried according to regulations.

**Activity 2.8.** CITES Management Authority organized a training course on "CITES implementation and prevention of illegal trade in wild animals and plants" for 55 Border, Customs, Environmental Police, Fisheries, Forest Protection, Marine Police, Fisheries Management Department from 15 provinces and cities in the South, completed in October 2018.



Figure 4: Training course on "CITES implementation and prevention of illegal trade in wild animals and plants, October 2018

**Activity 2.9.** 09 training courses for law enforcement officers including customs officers, police officers and forest rangers on the regulations on the control of wildlife trade and the amended Penal Code.



Figure 5: Training course on strengthening law enforcement and disseminating of the revised Criminal Law in the management of wildlife trade, January 2018



Figure 6: Training course of border forces on CITES implementation and strengthening skills on law enforcement on the management of wildlife trade across borders, border gates and land in November 2018

**Activity 2.10:** Supreme People's Court, in collaboration with UNODC, under the support of the GIG USAID Project and the Saving Species USAID Project: organized 03 training courses for judges from 63 provinces and cities across the country on crimes violating regulations on wildlife protection and forestry crimes



Figure 7: Awareness training course for judicial officers on the seriousness of wildlife crimes, especially on ivory and rhino horn related crimes

**Activity 2.11:** Reference book for law enforcement officers applying to wildlife crimes under the new Penal Code, including offenses related to ivory and rhino horn (Vietnamese version for reference <a href="here">here</a>).



Figure 8 (photo source: USS Project): Scientific workshop for consultation on draft Customs control pocket guide for wildlife and wildlife products, November 12, 2019

**Activity 4.6:** Propagating to raise public awareness about the protection and conservation of wildlife in general, ivory and rhino horn in particular.

The article about the event that the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development held a one-year report on the progress of implementing the Hanoi Declaration on combating illegal trade in wild animals and plants in May 2018 (refer <a href="here">here</a>).

The one-year progress report on the implementation of the Hanoi Declaration on cobating illegal trade in wild animals and plants (refer here).

Vietnam's commitment at the London Conference on combating the illegal trade of wild plants and animals in October 2001 (refer <a href="here">here</a>).

News from People's Television about the Millennium Village at the British Festival to propagandize law enforcement to combat against the illegal trade of wild animals and plants in Hanoi in November 2018 (refer <a href="here">here</a>).



Figure 9. (photo source: USS Project): Propagating and training for members of Vietnam E-commerce Association in November 2019 on wildlife.



Figure 10. (photo source: USS project): propaganda banner at Noi Bai international border gate airport, Hanoi in 2020



Figure 11. (photo source: USS project): propaganda banner at Noi Bai international border gate airport, Hanoi in 2020

Group 3. Data on arrests of ivory and rhino horn

	Iv	vory	Rhino horn		
Year	Number of case	Weight (kg)	Number of case	Weight (kg)	
2016	11	7.306,3	5	62,2	
2017	9	5.582,9	7	198,88	
2018	5	3.343,0	4	111,0	
2019	7	13.392	4	147,0	