Original language: English PC22 Doc. 20.3.3 (Rev. 1)

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Twenty-second meeting of the Plants Committee Tbilisi (Georgia), 19-23 October 2015

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation

Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II [Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP16)]

PERIODIC REVIEW OF SCLEROCACTUS SPP.

1. This document has been submitted by Mexico and the United States of America.*

Background

2. The United States submitted two proposals to transfer two *Sclerocactus* species from Appendix II to Appendix I at the 12th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP12; Santiago, 2002). The proposal (CoP12 Prop. 46) for *Sclerocactus nyensis* was adopted by the Parties. The proposal (CoP12 Prop. 47) for *Sclerocactus spinosior* subspecies *blainei* was withdrawn due to concerns raised at the meeting concerning the taxonomic status of this taxon.

- 3. At the 15th meeting of the Plants Committee (PC15; Geneva, 2005), the United States volunteered to conduct a periodic review of the genus *Sclerocactus* (PC15 WG3 Doc. 1 (Rev. 1)). The Plants Committee subsequently added the genus to the list of taxa for periodic review for the intersessional periods between the 13th (Bangkok, 2004) and 15th meetings of the Conference of the Parties (Doha, 2010).
- 4. The CITES Scientific Authority of the United States funded the study "Report on the evidence supporting generic and species circumscriptions in the genus *Sclerocactus* with recommendations for a biologically justified taxonomy that will be stable into the future; and biological assessments of species of concern" conducted by Dr. J. Mark Porter and Dr. Linda M. Prince, of the Rancho Santa Ana Botanic Garden, Claremont Graduate University, California, USA.
- 5. The United States has submitted two updates on the periodic review of *Sclerocactus* to the Plants Committee. The first, was submitted to the 19th meeting (<u>PC19 Doc. 13.3</u>; Geneva, 2011), and the second at the 21st meeting (<u>PC21 Doc. 19.3.3</u>; Veracruz, 2014).
- 6. In order to review and complement the recommendations of document PC21 Doc. 19.3.3 regarding Mexican species of Sclerocactus, since mid-2015 the Mexican Scientific Authority, the National Commission for Knowledge and Use of Biodiversity (CONABIO), is financing and coordinating a study titled "Assessment of the conservation status and taxonomy of Mexican species of Sclerocactus

^{*} The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.

(Cactaceae) listed under CITES Appendices," under the leadership of Dr. Salvador Arias of the Institute of Biology at the National Autonomous University of Mexico.

- 7. The genus Sclerocactus was listed in the CITES Appendices when the Convention entered into force on 1 July 1975, under the family listing of Cactaceae. The CITES Standard Reference for Cactaceae is the CITES Cactaceae Checklist 2nd ed. (Hunt 1999). The Checklist includes 31 Sclerocactus taxa comprised of 20 species and 11 subspecies (9 Appendix-I taxa and 22 Appendix-II taxa). However, the CITES Checklist of CITES Species (UNEP-WCMC) and the CITES Species+ database (UNEP-WCMC 2015) currently include 20 species and one subspecies.
- 8. Since the genus Sclerocactus was first described in 1922 (Britton and Rose), there has been considerable controversy concerning the generic boundaries of Sclerocactus at generic and lower levels due to morphological similarities and distribution overlap of taxa (Heil and Porter 2004; Hochstätter 2005; Porter and Prince 2011; Schwabe et al. 2013). Thus the number of recognized species within Sclerocactus is inconsistent among treatments. While some treatments of Sclerocactus employ a broad circumscription of Sclerocactus by including the genera Ancistrocactus, Echinomastus, Glandulicactus, and Toumeya within the single genus (e.g., Hunt et al. 2006; Butterworth 2015), other treatments employ a narrow circumscription of the genus, which exclude Ancistrocactus, Echinomastus, and Glandulicactus (Flora of North America 2004). Recent research, including phylogenetic and molecular analyses and morphological studies, support the inclusion of Ancistrocactus, Echinomastus, and Toumeya within Sclerocactus (Porter et al. 2000; Butterworth and Porter reviewed in Porter and Prince 2011; Porter and Prince 2011), and the exclusion of Glandulicactus (Butterworth et al. 2002; Hernández-Hernández et al. 2011). Porter and Prince's (2011) treatment includes Ancistrocactus, Echinomastus, Sclerocactus strict sense, and Toumeya, and excludes Glandulicactus, with the recognition of several infraspecific taxa, as a stable circumscription of Sclerocactus.
- 9. Sclerocactus range from southwestern United States to northern Mexico, with the majority of taxa distributed in the United States. Sclerocactus are slow-growing, single-stemmed, perennial succulents, cylindrical in shape with hooked spines; taxa are exceptionally cold and drought tolerant. Due to the extensive geographic range of Sclerocactus, taxa occur across diverse edaphic environments and climatic gradients. According to Hunt (1999), of the 31 CITES recognized taxa of Sclerocactus: 18 taxa are endemic to the USA; 10 taxa are native to the USA and México; and 3 taxa are endemic to Mexico.
- 10. Many *Sclerocactus* taxa are narrow endemics with limited ranges and distributions, and small population sizes (Anderson 2001; Hochstätter 2005; USFWS 2007, 2008, 2010, 2010a, 2010b, 2010c; Porter and Prince 2011; USFWS 2011, 2011a; Butterworth and Porter 2013; USFWS 2013; NatureServe 2015).
- 11. Wild collection of specimens includes both seeds and plants. Taxa are vulnerable to collection due to their biological life history traits, habitat degradation, and predation, which are exacerbated by prolonged drought and the effects of climate change. In particular, the restricted ranges of seven U.S. endemic taxa (Table 1, below) and the persistent threats are the primary justification for the proposed transfer of the taxa from Appendix II to Appendix I, including *Sclerocactus spinosor* ssp. blainei (= Sclerocactus blainei) originally proposed at CoP12 (Santiago, 2002). We are particularly concerned that the collection of seeds for commercial trade may negatively affect the long-term survival of these taxa.
- 12. With this document, the United States and Mexico provide the results and conclusions of the periodic review of all known *Sclerocactus* taxa except one species (*S. uncinatus* and infraspecific taxa) under review by Mexico. In addition, the United States has prepared a draft proposal for seven endemic *Sclerocactus* taxa with the intent of submitting the final proposal to the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP17; Johannesburg, 2016).

Results and conclusions

- 13. The CITES Scientific Authorities of Mexico and the United States have assessed its native and endemic Sclerocactus taxa under the guidelines of Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP16) on Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II.
- 14. We note that the purpose of the Periodic Review is to review species included in Appendices I and II to determine whether their listings continue to be appropriate based on current biological and trade information, and utilizing the listing criteria of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) on Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II. And that a successful periodic review may result in a recommendation

that the species is appropriately listed and should be retained as listed, or transferred from Appendix II to I, or transferred from Appendix I to II.

- 15. On the basis of its findings, the United States recommends the transfer of seven U.S. endemic *Sclerocactus* taxa from Appendix II to Appendix I in accordance with Article II, paragraph 1 of the Convention and meeting Criterion A i), ii), and v); B) iii) and iv; and C) ii) of Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), as shown in Table 1.
 - Criterion A, as wild populations are small and are characterized by an observed inferred or projected decline in the number of individuals; with each subpopulation being very small; and demonstrating a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors. Criterion B because populations are restricted and are characterized by a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors and an observed, inferred, or projected decrease in the number of subpopulations and the number of individuals. The taxa also meet Criterion C, as a marked decline in the size of populations is inferred due to a decrease in the quality of habitat; a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors; and a decrease in recruitment.
- 16. Table 1: U.S. Sclerocactus taxa proposed for transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.

Taxon	Recommendation
Sclerocactus blainei	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
[A valid species, formerly recognized as a synonym	
of Sclerocactus spinosor ssp. blainei.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus cloverae	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
[A valid species, formerly recognized as a synonym	
of Sclerocactus parviflorus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus cloverae ssp. brackii	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
[A valid taxon, formerly recognized as a synonym of	
Sclerocactus parviflorus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus cloverae ssp. cloverae	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
[A valid taxon.]	
	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus parviflorus ssp. havasupaiensis	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
Sclerocactus parviflorus ssp. terrae-canyonae	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
Sclerocactus sileri	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.

- 17. We find that the nine *Sclerocactus* taxa listed in Appendix I continue to meet the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I. In accordance with the following criteria for inclusion in Appendix I: Article II, paragraph 1 of the Convention, and meeting Criterion A i), ii), and v); B) iii) and iv; and C) ii) of Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), as follows.
 - Criterion A, as wild populations are small and are characterized by an observed inferred or projected decline in the number of individuals; with each subpopulation being very small; and demonstrating a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors. Criterion B because populations are restricted and are characterized by a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors and an observed, inferred, or projected decrease in the number of subpopulations and the number of individuals. The taxa also meet Criterion C, as a marked decline in the size of populations is inferred due to a decrease in the quality of habitat; a high vulnerability to intrinsic and extrinsic factors; and a decrease in recruitment.

Our recommendations are noted in Table 3.

18. With the exception of the four taxa under review by Mexico (*S. uncinatus, S. uncinatus ssp. crassihamatus, S. uncinatus ssp. uncinatus and S. uncinatus ssp. wrightii*), we find that all other *Sclerocatus* taxa listed in Appendix II continue to meet the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II.

In accordance with the following criteria for inclusion in Appendix II:

- Article II, paragraph 2 (a) of the Convention: Although the *Sclerocactus* taxa are not necessarily now threatened with extinction, they may become so unless trade in specimens of such species is subject to strict regulation in order to avoid utilisation incompatible with their survival.
- Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) Annex 2 a, criterion A. On the basis of available trade data and information on the status and trends of the wild populations of the *Sclerocactus* taxa, it is known, or can be inferred or projected, that the regulation of trade in the species is necessary to avoid it becoming eligible for inclusion in Appendix I in the near future.
- Resolution 9.24 (Rev. CoP15) Annex 2b criterion A. Identification of *Sclerocactus* species can be difficult for non-experts. National experience has shown that enforcement and customs officers who encounter specimens of CITES-listed *Sclerocactus* at the ports are unlikely to reliably distinguish between the various species of *Sclerocactus* or with other cacti taxa.

Our recommendations are noted in Table 3.

- 19. The periodic review also revealed that the taxonomy of *Sclerocactus* has changed since the 1999 publication of the CITES Cactaceae Checklist. Thus, the CITES recognized taxonomy conflicts with more recent taxonomic treatments of the genus in the United States and Mexico (e.g., two species recognized as members of Glandulicactus, synonymy recognized as valid species, a subspecies recognized as a synonym of the CITES-listed species).
- 20. Furthermore, the species *S. erectocentrus* and its varieties *erectocentrus* and *acunensis*, and the species *S. johnsonii* have historically been recognized as distinct taxa. However, recent research indicates that these taxa are morphologically similar (Baker 2007; Porter and Prince 2011; Baker 2012), thus providing evidence to support the inclusion of *S. erectocentrus* within *S. johnsonii*, and that several infraspecific taxa be recognized in this new alignment (Porter and Prince 2011; Baker 2012). Although we are not recommending this nomenclature change at this time, we note that it should be taken into consideration in the current revision of the *CITES Cactaceae Checklist*.
- 21. Although the *Checklist* is being updated, we do not know whether the treatments of *Sclerocactus* will include nomenclature recognized in Mexico and the United States. Therefore, we recommend that the taxa, as noted in Table 2, be recognized as valid taxa, and that the CITES Species Database be amended accordingly. Additional information on the *Sclerocactus* taxa is provided in the United States draft CoP17 proposal, noted in paragraph 12. Mexico will also provide information with regards to the *Glandulicactus* taxa (CITES-listed *S. uncinatus*) at PC22.
- 22. Table 2: Amendments to the CITES Species Database and CITES Checklist.

Taxon	Recommendation
Sclerocactus brevispinus	Retain in Appendix I.
[A valid species, formerly recognized as a synonym	
of Sclerocactus glaucus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus wetlandicus	Retain in Appendix I.
[A valid species, formerly recognized as a synonym	
of Sclerocactus glaucus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus erectocentrus var. acunensis	Retain in Appendix I.
[A valid taxon, formerly recognized as a synonym of	
Sclerocactus erectocentrus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus erectocentrus var. erectocentrus	Retain in Appendix I.
[A valid taxon, formerly recognized as a synonym of	
Sclerocactus erectocentrus.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus intertextus var. dasyacanthus	Retain in Appendix II.
[A valid taxon.]	
	Amend the CITES Species Database.
Sclerocactus intertextus var. intertextus	Retain in Appendix II.
[A valid taxon.]	
	Amend the CITES Species Database.

Taxon	Recommendation					
Sclerocactus whipplei ssp. busekii	Synonym of Sclerocactus whipplei.					
[Subsumed into S. whipplei, formerly recognized as						
a subspecies.]	Amend the CITES Species Database.					
Glandulicactus uncinatus	Under revision by Mexico, findings to be					
[Valid nomenclature, formerly recognized as Sclerocactus uncinatus and S. uncinatus ssp.	reported at PC22.					
uncinatus]	Amend the CITES Species Database.					
Glandulicactus uncinatus ssp. wrightiae	Under revision by Mexico, findings to be					
[Valid nomenclature, formerly recognized as Sclerocactus uncinatus ssp. wrightiae]	reported at PC22.					
	Amend the CITES Species Database.					
Glandulicactus crassihamatus	Under revision by Mexico, findings to be					
[Valid nomenclature, formerly recognized as	reported at PC22.					
Sclerocactus uncinatus ssp. crassihamatus]						
	Amend the CITES Species Database.					

23. Table 3: Summary of the status and results for the periodic review of *Sclerocactus* taxa (grey shaded rows are proposed for amendment).

	Taxon+	CITES Reference*	Range Country	National designation (ND) and conservation status (CS)#	IUCN^ listing	Appendix Listing	Recommendation
1.	Sclerocactus blainei (Welsh & Thorne)	Yes, synonym of S. spinosor ssp. blainei (Welsh & Thorne) Hochstätter	USA	CS-Critically imperilled.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I. Amend the CITES Species Database
2.	Sclerocactus brevihamatus (Engelmann) Hunt	Yes	USA	CS-Vulnerable.	Least concern	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
3.	Sclerocactus brevihamatus ssp brevihamatus (Engelmann) Hunt	Yes	Mexico, USA	MX: Not ranked. USA: CS-Vulnerable.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
4.	Sclerocactus brevihamatus ssp tobuschii (Marshall) Taylor	Yes	USA	ND-Endangered.	Not ranked	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
5.	Sclerocactus brevispinus Heil & Porter	Yes, synonym of S. glaucus (Schumann) Benson	USA	ND-Threatened; CS- Critically imperilled.	Critically endangered	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I. Amend the CITES Species Database
6.	Sclerocactus cloverae Heil & Porter	Yes, synonym of S. parviflorus Clover & Jotter	USA	CS-Vulnerable.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I. Amend the CITES Species Database.
7.	Sclerocactus cloverae ssp. brackii Heil & Porter	Yes, synonym of S. parviflorus	USA	CS-Critically Imperiled; listed as endangered in New Mexico State.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I. Amend the CITES Species Database.
8.	Sclerocactus cloverae ssp. cloverae Heil & Porter	No	USA	CS-Vulnerable.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I. Amend the CITES Species Database.
9.	Sclerocactus erectocentrus (Coulter) Taylor	Yes	Mexico, USA	MX: Not ranked. USA: CS- Vulnerable.	Least concern	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.

	Taxon+	CITES Reference*	Range	National	IUCN^ listing	Appendix	Recommendation
	TaxOII+	CITES Reference	Country	designation (ND)	IOCN* listing	Listing	Recommendation
				and			
				conservation status (CS)#			
10.	Sclerocactus erectocentrus var. acunensis	Yes, synonym of S.	Mexico, USA	MX: ND-Endangered	Not ranked	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
	(W.T. Marshall) Bravo	erectocentrus	,	as Echinomastus		7,7	
				erectocentrus spp.			Amend the CITES Species Database.
				acuñensis. USA: ND-			
				Endangered as E.			
				erectocentrus var.			
				acuñensis; CS-Critically			
				imperilled.			
11.	Sclerocactus erectocentrus var.	Yes, synonym of S.	USA	Not ranked.	Not ranked	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
	erectocentrus (Coulter) Taylor	erectocentrus					Amend the CITES Species Database.
12.	Sclerocactus glaucus (Schumann) Benson	Yes	USA	ND-Threatened; CS-	Least concern	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
12.	Scierocacius giaucus (Schumann) Benson	165	USA	Imperiled.	Least concern	Аррепаіх і	Retain in Appendix I.
							Amend the CITES Species Database by
							deleting the synonyms S. brevispinus and S. wetlandicus.
13.	Sclerocactus intertextus (Engelmann)	Yes	Mexico, USA	MX: ND-Threatened,	Least concern	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
				as Echinomastus intertextus. USA: CS-			
				Apparently secure.			
14.	Sclerocactus intertextus (Engelmann)	No	Possibly	USA: CS- Critically	Not ranked	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
	Taylor		Mexico,	imperilled in Texas.			
	var. dasyacanthus		USA				Amend the CITES Species Database
15.	(Engelmann) Taylor Sclerocactus intertextus (Engelmann)	No	Mexico	MX: Not ranked.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
	Taylor var. intertextus (Engelmann)	NO	USA	USA: Not ranked	Not fallked	Appendix II	Amend the CITES Species Database
	(Engelmann) Taylor						
16.	Sclerocactus johnsonii (Engelmann) Taylor	Yes	Mexico	MX: Endangered,	Least concern	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
			USA	as Echinomastus erectocentrus ssp.			
				acuñensis.			
				USA: CS-Vulnerable.			
17.	Sclerocactus mariposensis (Hester) Taylor	Yes	Mexico, USA	MX: ND-Threatened,	Least concern	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
				as Echinomastus mariposensis.USA:			
				ND-			
				Threatened, as E.			
				mariposensis; CS-Imperiled.			
18.	Sclerocactus mesae-verdae (Boissevain &	Yes	USA	ND-Threatened; CS-	Least concern	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
	Davidson ex Marshall & Block) Benson			Imperiled.			,, .
19.	Sclerocactus nyensis Hochstätter	Yes	USA	CS-Critically	Endangered	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
20.	Oderson to an	V	1104	Imperilled.	Lacata	Assessment !	Datain in Annuality
20.	Sclerocactus papyracanthus (Engelmann) Taylor	Yes	USA	CS-Apparently secure.	Least concern	Appendix I	Retain in Appendix I.
21.	Sclerocactus parviflorus Clover & Jotter	Yes	USA	CS-Apparently	Least concern	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
20				secure.			
22.	Sclerocactus parviflorus	Yes	USA	Not ranked.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I.
	ssp. havasupaiensis (Clover) Hochstätter						
23.	Sclerocactus parviflorus	Yes	USA	CS-Vulnerable.	Not ranked	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
	ssp. intermedius						
	(Peebles) Heil & Porter						
24.	Sclerocactus parviflorus	Yes	USA	CS-Apparently	Not ranked	Appendix II	Retain in Appendix II.
	ssp. parviflorus			secure.			

II to Appendix I.
II to Appendix I.
тто дррених т.
ico, findings to be
, ,
cies Database.
ico, findings to be
cies Database.
ico, findings to be
cies Database.
Des Dalabase.
cies Database.
ecies Database to ocactus whipplei
љасказ үнтірріет
CITES Species
X

⁺ Taxonomic references: Flora of North America; Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS); and Porter and Price 2011.

- * CITES References: The CITES Cactaceae Checklist 2nd ed. (Hunt 1999); the CITES Checklist of CITES Species (UNEP-WCMC); and the CITES Species+ (UNEP 2015).
- # The National designation (ND) for Mexico, it is the Norma Oficial Mexicana NOM-059-SEMARNAT-2010; for the United States, it is the Endangered Species Act of 1973. The conservation status (CS) for United States is designated by NatureServe.
- ^ The IUCN Red List does not assess and classify taxa below the rank of species.

Recommendations to the Plants Committee

24. The Plants Committee is invited to:

- a) Endorse the recommendations of Mexico and the United States, as reported in Table 1, to amend the Appendices in accordance with the Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16).
- b) Endorse the draft proposal (under agenda item 22) submitted by the United States to amend the Appendices for seven *Sclerocactus* taxa in accordance with the Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16).
- c) Take note of the recommendations regarding the *Sclerocactus* taxa that are appropriately listed in the Appendices, as reported in Table 3.
- d) Take note of the progress on the four taxa under review by Mexico.
- e) In consultation with the Nomenclature Specialist of the Plants Committee, adopt the amendments proposed for the CITES species database, as well as the 3rd edition of the CITES Cactaceae Checklist, as reported in Table 2.
- f) Request the Nomenclature Specialist of the Plants Committee to, in collaboration with specialists appointed both by Mexico and the United States, review the taxonomic and nomenclatural issue raised in paragraph 20 of this document, regarding *Sclerocactus erectocentrus* and *S. johonsonii*.

25. References

The references are included in the United States draft *Sclerocactus* proposal, under agenda item 22: Proposals for possible consideration at CoP17.