

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
Panama City (Panama), 14 – 25 November 2022

Summary record of the sixth session for Committee II

17 November 2022: 09h10 - 12h00

Chair: R. Ollerenshaw (Australia)

Secretariat: I. Higuero  
T. Carroll  
T. Mcgregor  
J. Stahl

Rapporteurs: J. Robinson  
R. Sexton  
R. Mackenzie  
S. Rouse

**Species specific matters**

66. Elephants (Elephantidae spp.)

66.6 Report on the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS)

The Secretariat introduced CoP19 Doc. 66.6, which contained a report on the comprehensive analysis of the ETIS data carried out by TRAFFIC. The trend and cluster analysis as well as the identification of Parties requiring attention under the National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) process based on ETIS data were addressed in the document. Parties were categorized based on the extent to which they are affected by illegal trade in ivory as Category A, B and C as defined in the *Guidelines to the National Ivory Action Plan Process* in Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens*.

The Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) objected to its inclusion in Category A in the report, stating that it was mainly a transit country and drawing attention to the significant enforcement efforts it had undertaken. DRC, supported by Malaysia and Singapore furthermore emphasized the importance of forensic analysis to determine the source of ivory seized by Parties. The Center for Environmental Forensic Science added that information on the origin of ivory specimens was very limited, but that it is important to include the results of DNA analysis in the ETIS data and therefore Parties should share the results with ETIS. Singapore reported progress with forensic analysis studies and the analysis of samples collected from trafficked ivory to determine the country of origin. Singapore also called for increased collaboration on the analysis of ivory. Uganda expressed concern that there are a number of Parties that are not submitting data. Viet Nam reported it had made great efforts to tackle the illegal ivory trade and asked the Secretariat to reassess its analysis of their enforcement efforts. Togo noted difficulties in gathering the necessary data and asked for capacity-building assistance from the Secretariat. Malaysia raised concerns with the methodologies that have led to Malaysia being clustered with other source countries. Gabon suggested moving the methodologies to an Annex to improve readability.

The United States of America and Kenya did not support changing the final deadline for submission of seizure data by Parties. Kenya supported the possibility of a joint analysis of ETIS and MIKE data as suggested in paragraph 11 of the report. The United States noted that the low levels of illegal trade in ivory in 2020 were likely due to COVID-19 disruptions.

Document CoP19 Doc. 66.6 was noted.

#### 66.1 Implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens*

The Secretariat introduced document CoP19 Doc. 66.1. The Chair noted that it was comprised of five parts and that part 1 on *Closure of domestic ivory markets* would be discussed together with agenda item CoP19 Doc. 66.3 because these items are closely related.

Whilst expressing general support for the recommendations contained in the document. India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Sri Lanka, Thailand, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Island, the United States of America and Flora and Fauna International (FFI), also speaking on behalf of 12 observer organizations did not support the Secretariat's proposed amendment to the draft decisions in Annex 3 to replace "Directed to Parties" with "Directed to Asian elephant range states", highlighting that it was not just Asian elephant range States involved in such trade. Indonesia and Thailand added that non Asian elephant range states should also be expected to report, therefore this change should be made not only in Decision 18.226 (Rev. CoP19), but also in draft decisions 19.AA and 19.BB in the document.

The United Kingdom additionally proposed that the word "minimum" be deleted from draft decision 19.AA b). Sri Lanka, supported by FFI (speaking also on behalf of 12 observer organizations), proposed the insertion of "in collaboration with range States and other relevant stakeholders" after "availability of external funding" in draft decision 19.AA b).

The United States of America supported the revised draft decisions in Annex 4 to the document, including draft decision 19.AA, and suggested that this should include an instruction directing the Secretariat to work with relevant experts in the trade in live Asian elephants.

The European Union and its Member States and the United States of America supported the draft decisions proposed in Annex 2 to the document with the amendments made by the Secretariat in its comments, ensuring that no additional resources were used to undertake work on mammoth ivory. The European Union and its Member States also supported the renewal of Decision 18.226 and supported draft decisions 19.AA and 19.BB in Annex 3 to the document with the proviso that it be directed to all Parties. It agreed to the deletion of Decisions 18.182 and 18.183 and supported the proposed revisions of Decisions 18.184 and 18.185 contained in Annex 4.

India stated that they supported measures to close legal markets in Asian elephant products and explained that they had been taking measures to better manage captive elephants. Thailand offered to share details of the system they have in place for captive elephants and tigers. The Association of Zoos and Aquariums (AZA) shared information relating to the support provided by AZA to Asian elephant range States and offered to provide further assistance to range States.

China and Japan opposed the two draft decisions in Annex 2, but Japan added that it would be appropriate to continue work only when external funding was available.

The Committee accepted the revisions of Decisions 18.117 and 18.119 in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 66.1 and to maintain Decision 18.118. The decisions in Annex 2 were accepted with the amendments proposed by the Secretariat. The Committee accepted the decisions in Annex 3 with amendments to 18.226 (Rev. CoP19) to direct the decision to Parties and not only the Asian elephant range States and the following amendments to draft decisions 19.AA and 19.BB:

#### ***Directed to the Secretariat***

**19.AA** The Secretariat shall:

- a) request a report from ~~Parties Asian elephant range States~~ on the implementation of paragraphs a) through d) of Decision 18.226 (Rev. CoP19);

- b) subject to the availability of external funding, in collaboration with range States and other relevant stakeholders develop ~~minimum~~ requirements for a registering, marking and tracing system for live Asian elephants, to be presented to Asian elephant range States with the aim of establishing a global system, or alternatively standardized national systems, for registering, marking and tracing live Asian elephants; and

.....

#### ***Directed to the Standing Committee***

**19.BB** The Standing Committee shall consider at its 78th meeting the information, findings and recommendations, as per Decision 19.AA, paragraph c), and make recommendations to the Secretariat and to Parties Asian elephant range States, and report to the Conference of the Parties at its 20th meeting, as appropriate.

The decisions in Annex 4 were accepted.

The Committee agreed to delete Decisions 18.120, 18.121, 18.227, 18.182 and 18.183.

#### **Species specific matters**

##### 66. Elephants (Elephantidae spp.)

##### 66.3 Implementing aspects of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on the closure of domestic ivory markets

Burkina Faso, as one of the co-proponents, introduced document CoP19 Doc. 66.3.

Benin, Burkina Faso, Gabon, Kenya, Senegal, Togo and the Japan Tiger and Elephant Fund supported the adoption of the draft decisions in document CoP19 Doc. 66.3, emphasizing the role of domestic ivory markets in contributing to poaching and illegal trade.

Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland only supported draft decision 19.DD in the document and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland expressed the hope that the work envisaged in that decision could be completed by the 77th meeting of the Standing Committee. The European Union and its Member States, Thailand and Zimbabwe supported draft decision 19.DD with the amendments proposed by the Secretariat.

The IWMC-World Conservation Trust and the South African Taxidermy & Tannery Association opposed the draft decisions in the document. Botswana, Thailand, the United Arab Emirates and Zimbabwe were of the view that domestic ivory markets were not within the mandate of CITES. Botswana and Japan stated that consensus on measures to be implemented by Parties relating to legal domestic ivory markets had been reached at CoP18 and that the provisions in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) are adequate to address this matter. Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates emphasized the importance of addressing illegal trade in ivory. TRAFFIC observed that draft decision 19.DD lacked specific objectives for the analysis and terms of reference.

Japan proposed the addition of a subparagraph b) to read: “ensure that Parties have access to any data used in its analysis, including but not limited to, statistical methodology, underlying code, and any supporting documentation”.

The Plurinational State of Bolivia, Botswana, Cambodia, Namibia and South Africa expressed support for Japan’s proposed amendment. The European Union and its Member States, Kenya, Mali and Niger opposed it.

Noting some support for draft decision 19.DD as amended by the Secretariat, the Chair invited delegates to indicate whether the agreement could be reached on the draft decision as amended by the Secretariat. The Plurinational State of Bolivia, Botswana, Cambodia, the European Union and its Member States, Namibia, South Africa and Zambia supported draft decision 19.DD as amended by the Secretariat. Japan stated that, in the spirit of compromise, it could accept the Chair’s proposal to agree draft decision 19.DD as amended by the Secretariat and expressed its hope that transparency would be ensured in the implementation of this decision.

Benin, Burkina Faso, Gabon, Kenya, Liberia, Mali and Niger did not support amendment by the Secretariat to draft decision 19.DD.

Liberia asked for a vote on the acceptance of draft decision 19.DD as originally set out in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 66.3.

With a vote of 39 Parties in favour, 58 opposed and 5 abstentions, the original draft decision 19.DD as outlined in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 66.3 was rejected.

Draft decision 19.DD as amended by the Secretariat in its comments in document CoP19 Doc. 66.3 was accepted as follows.

***Directed to the Secretariat***

19.DD Subject to external funding, the Secretariat shall engage the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group and TRAFFIC to advise whether an analysis of ivory seizures connected to each Party with a legal domestic market for commercial trade in ivory could be undertaken and, if feasible, carry out the analysis and include the results analysis in the ETIS report to the Standing Committee at its 77th and 78th meetings, and to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

**66.7 Review of the National Ivory Action Plan process**

Malawi introduced document CoP19 Doc 66.7 on the need for a systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of the National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) process. Malawi agreed with the suggested amendments of the Secretariat contained in paragraphs 19.AA a) i), a) ii) and b) and indicated that a new decision directed to the Standing Committee has been prepared.

The United States expressed its intention to continue to support the NIAP process and congratulated Parties which have accomplished their NIAPs. It did not support the suggested amendment by the Secretariat to the chapeau of draft decision 19.AA and wished to retain the original wording to contract a consultant to undertake the work under the draft decisions.

Liberia, Malaysia, and Senegal expressed support for the document, with Malaysia supporting the Secretariat's amendments.

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.



Motion Item 66.3 [17.11.2022 11:40:07 AM]

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: individual

YES: 40.21%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	YES
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	Not Allowed
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	NO
7	ARGENTINA	YES
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	NO
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	Not Present
12	BAHRAIN	NO
13	BANGLADESH	YES
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	NO
17	BELIZE	Not Present
18	BENIN	YES
19	BHUTAN	Not Present
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	NO
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	NO
23	BRAZIL	NO
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	NO
26	BURKINA FASO	YES
27	BURUNDI	YES
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	NO
30	CAMEROON	YES
31	CANADA	NO
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	YES
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	ABST
35	CHINA	ABST
36	COLOMBIA	Not Present
37	COMOROS	YES
38	CONGO	Not Present
39	COSTA RICA	YES
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	Not Present
41	CROATIA	NO
42	CUBA	NO
43	CYPRUS	NO
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	NO
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	NO
46	DENMARK	NO
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	YES



Motion Item 66.3 [17.11.2022 11:40:07 AM]

50	ECUADOR	YES
51	EGYPT	Not Present
52	EL SALVADOR	NO
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	YES
55	ESTONIA	NO
56	ESWATINI	NO
57	ETHIOPIA	YES
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Present
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	NO
61	FRANCE	NO
62	GABON	YES
63	GAMBIA	Not Present
64	GEORGIA	Not Present
65	GERMANY	NO
66	GHANA	ABST
67	GREECE	NO
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	YES
70	GUINEA	YES
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	YES
72	GUYANA	Not Present
73	HONDURAS	Not Present
74	HUNGARY	NO
75	ICELAND	Not Present
76	INDIA	YES
77	INDONESIA	YES
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	NO
81	ISRAEL	YES
82	ITALY	NO
83	JAMAICA	YES
84	JAPAN	NO
85	JORDAN	Not Present
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	Not Allowed
88	KUWAIT	Not Present
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	NO
91	LATVIA	NO
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	Not Present
94	LIBERIA	YES
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	Not Present
97	LITHUANIA	NO
98	LUXEMBOURG	NO
99	MADAGASCAR	Not Present
100	MALAWI	YES
101	MALAYSIA	NO
102	MALDIVES	NO



Motion Item 66.3 [17.11.2022 11:40:07 AM]

103	MALI	YES
104	MALTA	NO
105	MAURITANIA	Not Present
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	NO
108	MONACO	Not Present
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	Not Present
111	MOROCCO	Not Present
112	MOZAMBIQUE	Present
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	NO
115	NEPAL	NO
116	NETHERLANDS	NO
117	NEW ZEALAND	NO
118	NICARAGUA	Not Present
119	NIGER	YES
120	NIGERIA	Present
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	NO
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	Not Present
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	Not Allowed
127	PANAMA	YES
128	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	YES
129	PARAGUAY	Not Present
130	PERU	NO
131	PHILIPPINES	YES
132	POLAND	NO
133	PORTUGAL	NO
134	QATAR	Not Allowed
135	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	NO
136	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	YES
137	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
138	ROMANIA	NO
139	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Not Present
140	RWANDA	Not Allowed
141	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
142	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
143	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
144	SAMOA	Not Present
145	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
146	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
147	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
148	SENEGAL	YES
149	SERBIA	Not Allowed
150	SEYCHELLES	Not Present
151	SIERRA LEONE	Not Present
152	SINGAPORE	ABST
153	SLOVAKIA	NO
154	SLOVENIA	NO
155	SOLOMON ISLANDS	NO



Motion Item 66.3 [17.11.2022 11:40:07 AM]

156	SOMALIA	Not Allowed
157	SOUTH AFRICA	NO
158	SPAIN	NO
159	SRI LANKA	ABST
160	SUDAN	Not Present
161	SURINAME	YES
162	SWEDEN	NO
163	SWITZERLAND	NO
164	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	Present
165	TAJIKISTAN	Not Allowed
166	THAILAND	NO
167	TOGO	YES
168	TONGA	NO
169	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	Not Present
170	TUNISIA	YES
171	TÜRKIYE	YES
172	UGANDA	YES
173	UKRAINE	Not Allowed
174	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	NO
175	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	YES
176	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	NO
177	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	YES
178	URUGUAY	Not Present
179	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
180	VANUATU	Not Present
181	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	Not Present
182	VIET NAM	YES
183	YEMEN	Not Present
184	ZAMBIA	NO
185	ZIMBABWE	NO