

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Panama City (Panama), 14 - 25 November 2022

Summary record of the seventh session for Committee I

17 November 2022: 19h10 – 21h50

Chairs: V. Fleming (United Kingdom of Great Britain and
Northern Ireland)

Secretariat: I. Higuero
I. Camarena
D. Morgan
J. C. Vazquez

Rapporteurs: F. Davis
C. Stafford
J. Mark
S. Rouse
A. Caromel
J. Robinson

Proposals to amend the Appendices

89. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

India, speaking also on behalf of Nepal, the co-proponent, introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 47** to delete *Dalbergia sissoo* from Appendix II. India noted that the species has a wide geographic distribution in the Indian sub-continent, a fast growth rate, and is found abundantly in the wild. It highlighted that exports of *D. sissoo* products from India had decreased drastically since the inclusion of the species in Appendix II with negative livelihood impacts on those involved in the trade. India considered that the species could be differentiated from other *Dalbergia* species using wood anatomy, mass spectrometry and DNA analysis.

Bangladesh supported the proposal. Argentina, Australia, Canada, the European Union and its Member States, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and the World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF) voiced regret that they could not support it. The European Union and its Member States agreed that the species does not meet the criteria for inclusion in Annex 2 a) paragraphs A and B of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II*, but alongside Canada and the United Kingdom it considered that the species continued to meet the 'look-alike' criteria. These Parties raised concerns that the removal of *D. sissoo* from Appendix II would create opportunities to launder other species of *Dalbergia* as *D. sissoo*.

Recognising the livelihoods issues raised, Bhutan proposed an amendment to annotation #15 to include the following:

"f) finished furniture and handicraft products of *Dalbergia sissoo* when first exported from India and Nepal"

instead of the deletion of *D. sissoo* from Appendix II. India and Nepal agreed to this amendment. Sri Lanka and IWMC-World Conservation Trust, noting the difficulties that had resulted from the listing of the species,

supported the proposed amendment. The European Union and its Member States, the United Kingdom and World Wide Fund for Nature opposed it.

The Chair called for a vote on proposal CoP19 Prop. 47 as amended. With 30 votes in favour, 55 against and 9 abstentions, the proposal was rejected.

Brazil introduced **proposal CoP 19 Prop. 49** to transfer *Paubrasilia echinata* from Appendix II to Appendix I with an annotation "All parts, derivatives and finished products, including bows of musical instruments, except musical instruments and their parts, composing travelling orchestras, and solo musicians carrying musical passports in accordance with Resolution Conf. 16.8 (Rev. CoP17) on *Frequent cross-border non-commercial movements of musical instruments*", highlighting the serious impact of illegal harvest to supply bows for musical instruments.

Argentina, Guatemala, Panama and Species Survival Network (also on behalf of Defenders of Wildlife) expressed support for the proposal.

The European Union and its Member States agreed that increased control of the species was necessary to tackle laundering of wild-sourced finished bows in trade. However, it opposed the annotation suggested in proposal CoP19 Prop. 49 and expressed doubts whether the addition of an annotation to an Appendix-I listing would be possible under the Convention. It suggested the species be retained in Appendix II with the following annotation:

"All parts, derivatives and finished products. Re-export of finished musical instruments and finished musical instrument accessories is exempt from the listing"

The United States of America, recognising the concerns expressed by Brazil and agreeing that it would be contrary to the Convention to annotate an Appendix I species, proposed amending the current Appendix II annotation as follows:

"All parts and derivatives, except finished bows for stringed musical instruments when transported only for the purposes of personal use, performance, display or competition"

The European Union and its Member States and United States, supported by Canada and Guatemala, suggested the proposal be discussed further within an in-session working group; Australia, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the International Association of Violin and Bow Makers and League of American Orchestras expressed interest in participating.

Brazil, reflecting on the discussion, noted the apparent general agreement among Parties that *P. echinata* meets the criteria for Appendix I, and stated it was open to work with Parties to reach an agreement on commercial and logistical issues.

The Chair established an in-session working group comprising Argentina, Australia (Chair), Brazil, Canada, European Union, Guatemala, Japan, Panama, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the United States of America, Chambre Syndicale de la Factice Instrumentale, International Association of Violin and Bow Makers, IWMC-World Conservation Trust, Species Survival Network and League of American Orchestras, with the following terms of reference: "see if there is scope to seek consensus on a possible amendment to proposal CoP19 Prop. 49 on *Paubrasilia echinata*".

Senegal on behalf of the co-proponents introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 50** to list the African populations of *Pterocarpus* spp. in Appendix II with annotation #17, including already listed species *P. erinaceus* (CoP17, no annotation) and *P. tinctorius* (CoP18, annotation #6). It recommended the Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew Plants of the World Online (POWO) database as the standard nomenclatural reference for the species. Senegal highlighted the recent increase in international demand for *Pterocarpus* spp. for the precious woods and rosewood market. The nomenclature specialist of the Plants Committee confirmed that she had been consulted on the proposed standard reference and was in agreement with the use of POWO, if the proposal were accepted.

Argentina, Benin, Burkina Faso, Costa Rica, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Liberia, Mauritania, Mexico, Niger, Nigeria, Peru, the Gambia, and the Environmental Investigation Agency (USA) supported the proposal. Cameroon supported the inclusion of *Pterocarpus soyauxii* in Appendix II but was not in favour of inclusion of other *Pterocarpus* spp. Congo opposed the proposal.

The Chair noted the general support for proposal CoP19 Prop. 50 but recognized the reservations expressed by Cameroon and Congo. Cameroon indicated it could support the proposal given the evidence of illegal trade. Congo acknowledged the majority opinion. The Chair thanked both Parties for their flexibility and noted their comments.

The proposal to include African populations of *Pterocarpus* spp. in Appendix II with annotation #17, including already listed species *P. erinaceus* (CoP17, no annotation) and *P. tinctorius* (CoP18, annotation #6) and following POWO as the recommended standard nomenclatural reference was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 51 to include the African populations of the genus *Khaya* spp. in Appendix II with annotation #17 was introduced by the European Union and its Member States, which, recognising potential difficulties in implementation, stated that it was open to an amendment to delay implementation of the listing by 12 months.

Senegal, as co-proponent, Burkina Faso, the Gambia, Liberia, Mauritania, Nigeria, the United Republic of Tanzania, and the Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL) supported the proposal. The United Republic of Tanzania, noting the potential challenges in implementation given that the listing only included African populations, called for relevant stakeholders to support capacity-building on appropriate wood identification technologies and traceability.

Cameroon opposed the proposal, calling for further studies to be carried out to determine the threats faced by each species within the genus for individual decisions to be taken rather than listing as a genus. The International Wood Products Association, speaking also on behalf of SUCO-sa, also opposed the proposal, stating that the major importers already complied with robust import laws and enforcement.

Cameroon agreeing to align with the majority in the spirit of compromise, proposal CoP 19 Prop. 51, to include the African populations of the genus *Khaya* spp. in Appendix II with annotation #17, was accepted by consensus.

Species specific matters

Maintenance of the Appendices

84. Standard nomenclature

84.3 Standard nomenclature for *Khaya* spp.

The European Union and its Member States introduced document CoP19 Doc. 84.3, amending the proposed standard nomenclatural reference for the genus *Khaya* to Plants of the World Online and noted that this change was supported by the nomenclature specialist of the Plants Committee. It further proposed adoption of the draft decision with the Secretariat's amendments.

Gembloux Agro-Bio Tech - University of Liège suggested that available information on morphological characteristics be used to resolve the nomenclature without waiting for the results of further study. The Chair indicated that provision was made through the draft decision for the Plants Committee to evaluate any issues related to nomenclature of *Khaya* spp. and propose recommendations to the next Conference of the Parties.

The amended standard nomenclatural reference and the draft decision in document CoP19 Doc. 84.3, as amended by the Secretariat, were accepted.

Proposals to amend the Appendices

89. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 43, containing a number of suggested amendments to Flora species with annotation #1, #4, #14 and Appendix-I listed species of Orchidaceae, was introduced by Canada. Canada explained that these amendments had been made following consensus and recommendations by the Standing Committee at its 74th meeting (Lyon, 2022).

The United States of America supported the proposed amendments related to tissue culture to reflect changes to techniques while maintaining the original intent of the exception and the minor amendments to

annotation #14 paragraph f), to address inconsistencies across the translations. It requested that it be noted for the record that with regard to exceptions for seedling and tissue cultures obtained *in vitro*, transported in sterile containers, seedlings of tissue cultures taken out of sterile containers no longer qualify for the exception included in the annotations, regardless of subsequent use or purpose. According to paragraph 11 of Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*, the country in which the specimens are removed from sterile containers is then the country of origin. This is also noted in the report of the Standing Committee working group on annotations, document SC74 Doc. 81, paragraph 7).

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 43 was accepted by consensus.

Species specific matters

Maintenance of the Appendices

85. Annotations

85.1 Report of the Standing Committee

The Chair reopened document CoP19 Doc. 85.1, discussion of which had deferred until proposal CoP19 Prop. 43 had been addressed.

The recommendation in paragraph 10 a) of document CoP19 Doc. 85.1 was accepted.

The meeting was adjourned at 21h50.



Motion Prop 47 amd [17.11.2022 7:49:03 PM]

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%
EU-Vote: block
YES: 35.29%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	Not Present
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	Not Allowed
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	Not Present
7	ARGENTINA	NO
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	NO
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	ABST
12	BAHRAIN	YES
13	BANGLADESH	YES
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	NO (eu)
17	BELIZE	Not Present
18	BENIN	NO
19	BHUTAN	YES
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	Not Present
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	Not Present
23	BRAZIL	ABST
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	NO (eu)
26	BURKINA FASO	NO
27	BURUNDI	Not Present
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	Present
30	CAMEROON	YES
31	CANADA	NO
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	Not Present
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	YES
35	CHINA	YES
36	COLOMBIA	YES
37	COMOROS	Not Present
38	CONGO	Not Present
39	COSTA RICA	ABST
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	Not Present
41	CROATIA	NO (eu)
42	CUBA	Not Present
43	CYPRUS	NO (eu)
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	NO (eu)
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	Not Present
46	DENMARK	NO (eu)
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	Not Present



Motion Prop 47 amd [17.11.2022 7:49:03 PM]

50	ECUADOR	NO
51	EGYPT	Not Present
52	EL SALVADOR	NO
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	Not Present
55	ESTONIA	NO (eu)
56	ESWATINI	YES
57	ETHIOPIA	Not Present
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Present
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	NO (eu)
61	FRANCE	NO (eu)
62	GABON	Not Present
63	GAMBIA	Present
64	GEORGIA	YES
65	GERMANY	NO (eu)
66	GHANA	NO
67	GREECE	NO (eu)
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	NO
70	GUINEA	NO
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	YES
72	GUYANA	ABST
73	HONDURAS	NO
74	HUNGARY	NO (eu)
75	ICELAND	YES
76	INDIA	YES
77	INDONESIA	ABST
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	NO (eu)
81	ISRAEL	NO
82	ITALY	NO (eu)
83	JAMAICA	ABST
84	JAPAN	NO
85	JORDAN	Not Present
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	Present
88	KUWAIT	Present
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	Not Present
91	LATVIA	NO (eu)
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	Not Present
94	LIBERIA	YES
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	YES
97	LITHUANIA	NO (eu)
98	LUXEMBOURG	NO (eu)
99	MADAGASCAR	Not Present
100	MALAWI	Not Present
101	MALAYSIA	NO
102	MALDIVES	NO



Motion Prop 47 amd [17.11.2022 7:49:03 PM]

103	MALI	YES
104	MALTA	NO (eu)
105	MAURITANIA	NO
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	YES
108	MONACO	YES
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	Not Present
111	MOROCCO	Not Present
112	MOZAMBIQUE	YES
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	NO
115	NEPAL	YES
116	NETHERLANDS	NO (eu)
117	NEW ZEALAND	NO
118	NICARAGUA	Not Present
119	NIGER	NO
120	NIGERIA	YES
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	NO
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	Not Present
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	ABST
127	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	Not Present
128	PARAGUAY	Not Present
129	PERU	YES
130	PHILIPPINES	YES
131	POLAND	NO (eu)
132	PORTUGAL	NO (eu)
133	QATAR	Not Allowed
134	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	NO (eu)
135	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	Present
136	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
137	ROMANIA	NO (eu)
138	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	ABST
139	RWANDA	Not Allowed
140	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
141	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
142	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
143	SAMOA	Not Present
144	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
145	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
146	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
147	SENEGAL	NO
148	SERBIA	Not Allowed
149	SEYCHELLES	Not Present
150	SIERRA LEONE	NO
151	SINGAPORE	NO
152	SLOVAKIA	NO (eu)
153	SLOVENIA	NO (eu)
154	SOLOMON ISLANDS	Not Present
155	SOMALIA	Not Allowed



Motion Prop 47 amd [17.11.2022 7:49:03 PM]

156	SOUTH AFRICA	YES
157	SPAIN	NO (eu)
158	SRI LANKA	YES
159	SUDAN	Not Present
160	SURINAME	ABST
161	SWEDEN	NO (eu)
162	SWITZERLAND	YES
163	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	Not Present
164	TAJIKISTAN	Not Allowed
165	THAILAND	Not Present
166	TOGO	NO
167	TONGA	YES
168	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	Not Present
169	TUNISIA	Not Present
170	TÜRKIYE	YES
171	UGANDA	Not Present
172	UKRAINE	Not Allowed
173	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	YES
174	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	NO
175	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	NO
176	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	NO
177	URUGUAY	NO
178	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
179	VANUATU	Not Present
180	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	Not Present
181	VIET NAM	YES
182	YEMEN	Not Present
183	ZAMBIA	Not Present
184	ZIMBABWE	YES